

The Miraculous Key
that Opens the Door
to the *All-encompassing Treasury of Knowledge*
and Summarizes the Reasonings Presented in
the *Ocean of Texts on Logic*

by Khenpo Tsültrim Gyamtso Rinpoche

Under the Guidance of
Khenpo Tsültrim Gyamtso Rinpoche
and Āchārya Sherab Gyaltsen Negi
translated by Ari Goldfield

Copyright 1997, Marpa Institute for Translation.

Cover design by Sherab, Chime, and Tsepak Dorje.

Published by:

Marpa Institute for Translation

P.O. Box 4017

Kathmandu, Nepal

Phone: 977-1-479-676

Email: main@mit.wlink.com.np

Marpa Institute for Translation

THE MIRACULOUS KEY
By Khenpo Tsultrim Gyamtso Rinpoche

Table of Contents

Introduction, pp. 5-7

- I. An analysis of the realms that appear in the kalpa of light, pp. 8-20**
 - A. An analysis with reasoning of the variety of appearances seen, pp. 8-11
 - B. An analysis of the reasons this variety of appearances seen, pp. 11-16
 - C. The extraordinary explanation of causes and conditions, pp. 16-20
- II. An analysis of how the teacher who tamed the beings in those realms appeared, pp. 21-28**
- III. An examination of the teachings, the genuine dharma, pp. 29-32**
- IV. An examination of how the victorious one's teachings have grown and flourished in this world, pp. 33-35**
- V. An analysis of how to train in right conduct that is supreme, pp. 36-38**
- VI. An explanation of how to give rise to the wisdom that comes from listening, pp. 39-58**
 - A. An examination of the common reasonings, pp. 39-46
 - B. An examination of the objects of knowledge that are explained in both the foundational vehicle and the great vehicle, pp. 47-49
 - C. An examination of the various views and tenets in the causal vehicle of characteristics, pp. 50-55
 - D. As an ancillary topic, a brief examination of the vajrayana, pp. 56-58
- VII. An analysis of how to gain certainty through reflection, pp. 59-78**
 - A. An analysis of gaining certainty about the keys to understanding, pp. 59-65
 - B. An analysis of gaining certainty about that which is to be understood, pp. 65-70
 - C. An examination of gaining certainty about the main thing, the view, pp. 70-75
 - D. An analysis of gaining certainty about a brief teaching on the four turnings of the mind from the tradition of pith instructions, pp. 75-78
- VIII. An analysis of how to verify what one has studied and reflected upon through meditation, pp. 79-82**
- IX. An examination of the manner of progressing along the grounds and paths, pp. 83-84**
- X. An analysis of the ultimate fruition, the kayas and wisdoms, pp. 85-88**

Conclusion, pp. 89-90

The Miraculous Key
By Khenpo Tsultrim Gyamtso Rinpoche

Summary Outline

- I. The Development of the Dharma**
 - A. The realms that appear in the kalpa of light**
 - 1. Causes and results generally
 - 2. The extraordinary explanation of causes and conditions
 - B. How the teacher who tamed the beings in those realms appeared**
 - C. The teachings, the genuine dharma**
 - D. How the victorious one's teachings have grown and flourished in this world**
- II. How to train in right conduct that is supreme**
 - A. The types of vows**
- III. The Development of Wisdom through listening, reflecting and meditating**
 - A. How to give rise to the wisdom that comes from listening**
 - 1. The common reasonings**
 - a) Objects and entities
 - b) Types of cognitions
 - c) Elements of reasoning
 - 2. The objects of knowledge that are explained in both the foundational vehicle and the great vehicle**
 - a) Aggregates (skandhas)
 - b) Elements (ayatanas)
 - c) Sources (dhatus)
 - 3. The various views and tenets in the causal vehicle of characteristics**
 - a) Foundational vehicle
 - b) Four Truths
 - c) Great vehicle schools
 - 4. As an ancillary topic, a brief examination of the vajrayana**
 - B. How to gain certainty through reflection**
 - 1. The keys to understanding**
 - 2. That which is to be understood**
 - a) The provisional and definitive meanings in the three turnings
 - b) The two truths
 - c) Dependent arising
 - 3. The main thing, the view**
 - a) Preliminaries: an explanation of the four seals that epitomize the sutras
 - b) Entering the path of giving up the two extremes
 - c) The main topic, an analysis of the two types of selflessness
 - 4. The four turnings of the mind from the tradition of pith instructions**
 - C. How to verify what one has studied and reflected upon through meditation**
 - 1. The way of accomplishing calm-abiding and superior insight according to the Middle Way tradition
 - 2. A summary of the types of calm abiding and superior insight
 - 3. Particularly the Middle Way school's explanation of meditative equipoise and subsequent attainment
- IV. The Path and the Result**
 - A. The manner of progressing along the grounds**
 - B. The ultimate fruition, the kayas and wisdoms**

THE MIRACULOUS KEY

By Khenpo Tsultrim Gyamtso Rinpoche

Detailed Outline of the Text

- I. An analysis of the realms that appear in the kalpa of light**
 - A. An analysis with reasoning of the variety of appearances seen**
 - 1. Definitions of various types of realms
 - 2. Refutations and proofs
 - 3. A verse for meditators
 - B. An analysis of the reasons why this variety of appearances is seen**
 - 1. The common explanation
 - a) Definitions
 - (1) Causes and results generally
 - (2) The six causes
 - (3) The five results
 - (4) The four conditions
 - b) Refutations and proofs
 - (1) Reasons concerning the quality of the subject
 - 2. The extraordinary explanation of causes and conditions
 - a) Definitions
 - (1) The three common explanations of the great vehicle
 - (a) The way the twelve dependently arisen links spin [beings through the cycle of existence]
 - (b) The way the eight collections of consciousness spin [beings through the cycle of existence]
 - (c) The way [beings'] three habitual tendencies confuse them
 - (2) The extraordinary assertions of the glorious Third Karmapa, Rangjung Dorje
 - (3) The special explanation of the tradition of the Great Perfection
 - b) All refutations and proofs gathered together
 - c) A verse for meditators
- II. An analysis of how the teacher who tamed the beings in those realms appeared**
 - A. An analysis of how the Buddha gave rise to the supreme awakening mind**

- B. An analysis of how in the interim, the Buddha conducted himself as a bodhisattva
 - C. An analysis of how the Buddha manifested his enlightenment
 - 1. The main analysis of where the Buddha became enlightened
 - 2. The ancillary analysis of where the teacher became enlightened: the highest pure land
 - D. A verse for meditators
- III. An examination of the teachings, the genuine dharma**
 - A. Definitions
 - 1. Types of dharma
 - 2. Types of the Buddha's speech
 - 3. Types of pitakas
 - B. Refutations and proofs
 - C. A verse for meditators
- IV. An examination of how the victorious one's teachings have grown and flourished in this world**
 - A. Definitions
 - 1. Various types of lands
 - B. Refutations and proofs collected together
 - C. A verse for meditators
- V. An analysis of how to train in right conduct that is supreme**
 - A. Definitions
 - 1. Types of vows
 - B. Refutations and proofs
 - C. A verse for meditators
- VI. An explanation of how to give rise to the wisdom that comes from listening**
 - A. An examination of the common reasonings**
 - 1. Definitions
 - a) Fields of study
 - b) Introduction to objects and entities
 - c) Aspects of time
 - d) Types of objects
 - (1) In terms of how they are taken as objects of awareness
 - (2) In terms of their character
 - (3) In terms of the availability
 - e) Terms of expression
 - f) Types of cognitions
 - g) Types of cognition of objects by subjects

- h) Elements of reasoning
 - 2. Refutations and proofs
 - 3. A verse for meditators
 - B. An examination of the objects of knowledge that are explained in both the foundational vehicle and the great vehicle**
 - 1. Definitions
 - a) Aggregates (skandhas)
 - b) Elements (ayatanas)
 - c) Sources (dhatus)
 - 2. Refutations and proofs
 - 3. A verse for meditators
 - C. An examination of the various views and tenets in the causal vehicle of characteristics**
 - 1. Definitions
 - a) Foundational vehicle
 - b) Four Truths
 - c) Great vehicle schools
 - 2. Refutations and proofs
 - a) Two reasons that can prove appearances to be mind
 - b) Five reasons that can prove that all phenomena are emptiness
 - c) Three reasons that establish that the Buddha Nature is actually and genuinely true
 - 3. A verse for meditators
 - D. As an ancillary topic, a brief examination of the vajrayana**
 - 1. Definitions
 - 2. Refutations and proofs
 - 3. A verse for meditators
- VII. An analysis of how to gain certainty through reflection**
- A. An analysis of gaining certainty about the keys to understanding**
 - 1. Definitions
 - 2. Refutations and proofs
 - B. An analysis of gaining certainty about that which is to be understood:**
 - 1. Definitions
 - a) The provisional and definitive meanings in the three turnings of the wheel of dharma
 - b) The two truths
 - c) Dependent arising
 - 2. Refutations and proofs
 - 3. A verse for meditators

- C. An examination of gaining certainty about the main thing, the view**
 - 1. The reason why it is necessary to have the accurate view
 - 2. An explanation of how to give rise to the view that realizes selflessness
 - 3. The preliminaries: an explanation of the four seals that epitomize the sutras
 - 4. Entering the path of giving up the two extremes
 - 5. The main topic, an analysis of the two types of selflessness
 - 6. An examination of the particular views of mantra
 - 7. In brief, the view of the unborn union
- D. An analysis of gaining certainty about a brief teaching on the four turnings of the mind from the tradition of pith instructions**
 - 1. Turning the mind away from attachment to this life
 - 2. Turning the mind away from attachment to the entirety of cyclic existence
 - 3. Turning the mind away from concern for one's own happiness and well-being
 - 4. Turning the mind away from perceiver and perceived
- VIII. An analysis of how to verify what one has studied and reflected upon through meditation**
 - A. The way of accomplishing calm-abiding and superior insight according to the Middle Way tradition
 - B. A summary of the types of calm abiding and superior insight
 - C. Particularly the Middle Way school's explanation of meditative equipoise and subsequent attainment
- IX. An examination of the manner of progressing along the grounds and paths**
 - A. Definitions
 - B. Refutations and proofs
 - C. A verse for meditators
- X. An analysis of the ultimate fruition, the kayas and wisdoms**
 - A. Definitions
 - B. Refutations and proofs
 - C. A verse for meditators

Translator's Preface

Contained in this volume is a translation of Khenpo Tsültrim Gyamtso Rinpoche's text, *The Miraculous Key that Opens the Door to the "All-Encompassing Treasury of Knowledge" and Summarizes the Reasonings Presented in the "Ocean of Texts on Logic"*,¹ or *The Miraculous Key*.

This work is of the genre of the "dü dra" (Tib: *bsdus grwa*), a primer text on logical reasoning and valid cognition that in the Tibetan Buddhist monastic universities is one of the first books to appear on the curriculum. By studying the dü dra, young students learn how to reason and debate with each other in the formalized manner that they will use throughout their course of study. The methods and rules of this type of reasoning and debate are formal but very clear, and as the students practice using them in their own studies and in debate with others, their analytical ability sharpens. The students thereby gain a highly effective tool that helps them to understand clearly the complex and subtle topics that they examine.

Khenpo Rinpoche's text is unique in this genre because it delves straight into the topics, questions, and debates that are at the heart of Buddhist philosophy. Because they are introductory texts, other dü dra works focus on more mundane topics, such as the systems of primary and secondary colors. Khenpo Rinpoche, however, wants his students to learn the most important and profound Buddhist philosophy at the same time they learn about how to understand and reason with it. Hence, a truly *Miraculous Key*.

The *Miraculous Key's* structure is that it follows the structure of chapters and topics of the *Treasury of Knowledge*,² Jamgön Kongtrül Lodrö Thaye's encyclopedic treatise on all aspects of Buddhist philosophy and meditation. Khenpo Rinpoche selects the essential definitions from each of the *Treasury of Knowledge's* ten chapters, and presents them in the *Miraculous Key*, along with reasonings and sample debates following the format taught by the seventh Gyalwang Karmapa, Chödrak Gyamtso, in his text on valid cognition, *The Ocean of Texts on Logic*.³ At the end of each section of the *Miraculous Key*, Rinpoche presents a verse for those who wish to meditate on the inherent nature of the topic he has just discussed, another feature which separates this text from others of its type.

This translation of the *Miraculous Key* is dedicated first and foremost to the text's author. Those who come into contact with Khenpo Rinpoche are both awed and inspired by his amazing combination of breadth of scholarship and yogic accomplishment. Incredibly, this awe and inspiration only deepens the longer one is fortunate enough to be able to know him. His students are universally grateful to him for his unfailing dedication to teaching the Dharma, his wisdom, patience, humor, and above all his

¹ In Tibetan, *shes bya kun khyab mdzod kyi sgo 'byed rigs gzhung rgya mtsho'i rigs bsdus 'phrul gyi lde mig*. Published in *blo rtags kyi rnam gzhag rigs gzhung rgya mtsho'i snying po dang rigs bsdus 'phrul gyi lde mig*, Karma Śrī Nālānda Institute, Rumtek, Sikkim, 1989.

² *Shes bya mdzod* or *Shes bya kun khyab*, published in three volumes by mi rigs dpe skrun khang, Beijing, 1985.

³ *Tshad ma rigs gzhung rgya mtsho*, published in four volumes by Phuntsok, Śrī Karma Raja Maha Vihara, Swayambunath, Kathmandu, 1989.

kindness. He is the beginning and end of all progress on the path.

This translation is also dedicated to all of Khenpo Rinpoche's senior students, from both East and West. All of them have been incredibly generous in sharing their knowledge, expertise, and experience, and incredibly kind, welcoming, and warm in their extension of friendship to a more recent arrival. They have been wonderful teachers and companions, and to them I feel a deep sense of gratitude. May all beginners on the path of Dharma have the good fortune to enjoy the guidance and company of such a sangha.

May the merit of this translation be a cause for all sentient beings to recognize, benefit from, and engage in enlightened activity. In particular, may it be a cause for the long life of His Eminence the fourth Jamgön Kongtrül Rinpoche, Karma Lodrö Chökyi Nyima. May his activity flourish and bring benefit to everyone!

Ari Goldfield
Marpa Institute for Translation, Kathmandu, Nepal
November 1997

The Miraculous Key

[74]⁴

By the power of having completely perfected an ocean of the
two accumulations,
You are the master of the ocean of kāyas and wisdom.
Through the ocean of your Buddha activity you liberate many beings,
Oh you ocean of supremely Mighty and Victorious Ones, I
revere you always.

Having given rise to the awakening mind, you perfected an
ocean of aspiration prayers,
And by so doing, you have performed the deeds of a
bodhisattva for an ocean of kalpas.
You are the embodiment of all of the ocean of the Victorious
Ones' primordial awareness,
Oh Lion of Speech,⁵ I worship you as the ornament that crowns
my head.

The emanation of Dharmakīrti, Chödrak Gyamtso,
Amassed this *Ocean of Texts on Logic*,
And you have assembled an ocean of fresh minds [who must develop] their intelligence,
Oh Rangjung Rigpe Dorje, I worship you as you sit on the
Lotus Throne in my heart.

The ocean of knowledge is deep, and its meaning difficult to fathom,
And the *Ocean of Texts on Logic* shows us reasoning's path,
So in order to benefit an ocean of fresh minds by [developing]
their intelligence,
I will summarize the *Treasury of Knowledge* and the *Ocean of
Texts on Logic* right here!

The text thus begins with this homage and promise to compose.

⁴ Numbers in brackets indicate page numbers in the Tibetan original. See note 1 for publication information.

⁵ Mañjuśrī

From the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,⁶

The subject, being the basis for distinctions to be made;
the distinctions themselves;
The presentation of what is to be ascertained; that which
causes ascertainment and demonstrates the
consequences [of the reasoning]; [75]
And the [resulting] view; these five are the way one
abides in the Middle Way.
The Lords of logic summarize it like this:
Understanding things with conventional [reasoning]
determines what genuine [reality] actually is.

Furthermore, the precious Lord of logic of the Practice Lineage, Garwang Chökyi Wangchuk,⁷ states:

Furthermore, as for these summarized reasonings,
If you really analyze, you will not find any beginning
or end,
Nor any middle place where [things might] abide.
All propositions fall apart,
And with no beginning or end, or any focusing on the middle,
With no propositions or philosophical tenets,
That is the Great Middle Way.

In accordance with that statement, I will now explain the summary of reasonings from the *Ocean of Texts on Logic*, as well as the [key points of] the *Treasury of Knowledge*, both of which ascertain the final result of valid cognition, the true nature of all phenomena: selflessness and the freedom from elaborations.

[To begin,] from the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,⁸

(1) The realms appearing in the Kalpa of Light;
(2) The Teacher, the Buddha; (3) the teachings: scripture and realization;
(4) How the teachings abide and flourish in the world;
(5) The way of discipline; (6) listening; (7) reflecting;
(8) meditating;
(9) Through the application of these, how one progresses along the path; and [76]
(10) the ultimate fruition; the body of this commentary is
presented [in ten sections], following the enumeration
of the ten transcendent perfections.

⁶ Vol. II, pp.243-4.

⁷ The sixth Sharmar Rinpoche.

⁸ Vol. I, p.4.

And so the *Treasury of Knowledge* has ten chapters, which I will explain in connection with the reasonings presented by the Lord of the Victorious Ones, the glorious Seventh Karmapa Chödrak Gyamtso, in his text, the *Ocean of Texts on Logic and Valid Cognition*.

This summary of reasonings of the *Ocean of Texts on Logic* and the *Treasury of Knowledge* is, [as above], divided into the following sections:

1. An analysis with reasoning of the realms appearing in the Kalpa of Light;
2. An analysis with reasoning of the way in which the Buddha, the Teacher and Tamer, came to this world;
3. An analysis of the way of the manifestation of the Buddha's teachings, the turnings of the wheel of Dharma of scripture and realization;
4. An analysis of how [the Dharma] spread and flourished in the world;
5. An analysis of how to enter into the Buddha's teachings in stages by way of practicing the disciplines of the vows of individual liberation, of the bodhisattva, and of the [secret] mantra;
6. How to cut through superimpositions by listening;
7. How to gain certainty through reflection;
8. How to verify [what one has studied and reflected upon] through meditation;
9. The way one progresses along the grounds (*bhūmis*) and paths;
10. The *kāyas* and wisdoms that are the ultimate fruition.

These ten chapters will now be explained in brief, in connection with the path of reasoning.

1. AN ANALYSIS OF THE REALMS THAT APPEAR IN THE KALPA OF LIGHT

1.1. An analysis with reasoning of the variety of appearances seen.

1.2. An analysis of the reasons why this variety of appearances is seen.

1.1.1. So that those mainly interested in learning may realize things easily, the various definitions are presented together. [77]

1.1.2. So that those mainly interested in reasoning may easily engage in it, the various refutations and proofs are presented together.

1.1.3. So that those mainly interested in practice may do so easily, this section concludes with a summarizing verse.

1.1.1. DEFINITIONS.

i) A realm where the Buddha's enlightened activity has manifested is a realm that appears in the Kalpa of Light.

ii) The world and its inhabitants whose collective appearance is mainly the result of actions taken by sentient beings is an impure realm.

iii) The world and its inhabitants that appear due to the power of bodhisattvas' past aspiration prayers and the Buddhas' blessings is a pure realm.

iv) The world and its inhabitants that appear due to the power of glorious Vajrasattva's blessings is the Realm of True Happiness [*mngon dga'i zhing khams, Abhirati*].

v) The world and its inhabitants that appear due to the power of the Buddha Ratnasambhava's blessings is the Glory-filled Buddha Realm to the South [*lho dpal dang ldan pa'i zhing khams, Śrīmat*].

vi) The world and its inhabitants that appear due to the power of the Buddha Amitabha's blessings is the Western Paradise of Great Bliss [*nub bde ba chen gyi zhing khams, Sukhāvatī*].

vii) The world and its inhabitants that appear due to the power of the Buddha Amogasiddhi's blessings is the Northern Realm of Perfect Activity [*byang las rab rdzogs pa'i zhing khams, Karmaprapūṇā*].

viii) The world and its inhabitants that appear due to the power of the Buddha Vairocana's blessings is the Richly Adorned Buddha Realm [*stuk po bkod pa'i zhing khams, Gaṇavyūha*].

ix) When everything that appears to oneself is incredibly pure and one is without any bias or prejudice,

that is the Highest Pure Land [*'og min*⁹ *gyi zhing, Akaniṣṭha*].

1.1.2. REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS.

i) Should someone say, [78] "If it is a realm that appears during the Kalpa of Light, it is definitely an impure realm," then the answer is, "It would then follow that the realms of the five Buddha families are impure, because they appear during the Kalpa of Light." And these realms do in fact appear during the Kalpa of Light, because they are realms in which the teachings of scriptures and realization appear. There is pervasion, because whether the Buddha's teachings are present or not depends upon [whether] the teachings of scripture and realization are present or not.

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, the answer to that is, "The realms of the five Buddha families are not impure realms, because they appear solely due to the power of bodhisattvas' past aspiration prayers and the power of the blessings of the Buddhas," and so forth, this point being established with [many] reasons.

ii) If someone says, "If it is a realm that appears during the Kalpa of Light, then it is definitely a pure realm," then the answer is, "It would then follow that the World-system of the Fearless¹⁰ is a pure realm because it appears during the Kalpa of Light."

If the proponent accepts the answering proposition, the answer then is, "The World-system of the Fearless cannot be a pure realm because it is an impure realm." And it is in fact an impure realm, because it is a realm that is gathered together by the actions and appearances of sentient beings. This is true, because as it is said, "The actions [of beings] produce the various world systems," and therefore, this world-system is produced by beings' activity.

iii) Should someone say, "If it is an impure realm that appears during the Kalpa of Light, [79] it is definitely a billion-fold (10^9) world-system," then the answer is, "It would then follow that the world-system with incredibly vast boundaries (10^9)², the world-system of the incredibly vast continuity (10^9)³, the incredibly vast ocean world-system (10^9)⁴, and the realm whose base and essence are ornamented by flowers (10^9)⁵, all world-systems that are described in the Great Vehicle, are not realms that appear during the Kalpa of Light, because they are bigger than the billion-fold world system. And they *are* bigger than the billion-fold world system, by exponential proportions.

iv) Should someone say, "If it is an impure world, it is definitely flat," then the answer is, "It would then follow that the world that the [Buddha stated in His] Great Vehicle [teachings] to be round is actually flat, because it is an impure world."

⁹ Literally, *'og min* means, "that which is not below".

¹⁰ *mi mjed 'jig rten*— a name for the billion-fold world system in which we live; called as such because bodhisattvas who are unafraid of the mental afflictions that plague sentient beings excellently appear within it in order to benefit others.

Should the proponent accept this answering proposition, then the response to that is, "If it is an impure world, it is not necessarily flat, for as [the Buddha said] in the *Avatamsaka sūtra*,¹¹

Some worlds are round, some are triangular,
Some of them are even square!

This and other statements prove that in the sūtras of the Great Vehicle, the Buddha described worlds of all varieties of shapes and sizes.

v) Should someone say, "If the explanation of how the universe is formed is Buddhist, it must be the explanation found in the Abhidharma,¹²" then the answer is, "It would then follow that the explanation given in the Kālacakra¹³ tradition is not a Buddhist way of explaining the formation of the universe, because it is different from the explanation in the Abhidharma." And it is in fact different from the Abhidharma's explanation, because in the Abhidharma, [80] [the Buddha said] that Mount Meru has four sides, and in the Kālacakra, [He said] it is circular. Furthermore, the explanation in the Abhidharma is not made in the context of outer, inner, and other, while the Kālacakra explanation is connected with outer, inner, and other.

vi) Someone may say, "There is a flaw in the Teacher, the Buddha, in that He was not omniscient, because these days we know that the world is round, but the Buddha did not say that the world is round." The answer to that is, "The Teacher, the Buddha, does not have such a flaw, because He spoke in accordance with the beliefs held by sentient beings during that day and age." That the Buddha taught in accordance with the prevailing beliefs of His time is proven by the fact that the explanation He gave in the Abhidharma about how the universe was formed is in harmony with the explanations of the [Indian] sages of old.

Further, it was necessary for the Buddha to teach in this way, because these teachings were in harmony with the beliefs of the Buddha's disciples at that particular time. That these teachings were given only to accord with the disciples' beliefs is proven by the fact that in other places, such as in the Great Vehicle in general, the glorious Kālacakra, and so forth, the Buddha gave a variety of different explanations of how the world originated. And as for these various explanations, there was a reason for giving them all, which was only that they were in harmony with the varying interests and capacities of the disciples [listening to them], and *not* that the Teacher Himself saw them to be true. This follows because He saw the [all] to be like illusions. [81] This follows because the Buddha taught that all phenomena are dream-like and illusory. For as He said in the sūtras,

Flickering stars and butter lamps,
Illusions, dew drops, and bubbles [on the waters' surface],
Dreams, flashes of lightning, and [passing] clouds,

¹¹ phal chen

¹² See section 3.1, xi.

¹³ {dus 'kor} "Wheel of Time".

View [all] composite phenomena to be like that.

And as is stated in the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,

The Buddha did not teach according to these extreme
[views] due to any gross conceptualization on His part,
He taught that way because of the beliefs of His disciples.

There is also another reason for giving different explanations of how the universe originated, which is that [beings] have different ways of looking at one base, at one given thing to be seen. This follows, because at any particular time that the six classes of beings look at the same pool of water, [six] different things appear to them. This follows, because: people see water; animals see a place to live; hungry ghosts see pus and blood; [beings trapped in the] hot hells see molten iron; and gods see nectar. It follows that they do see things in this manner, because direct valid cognition establishes the fact that humans and animals have different ways of perceiving, and from this we can validly infer that other beings have different ways of perceiving as well.

There is another reason that proves that the six kinds of beings have six different ways of perceiving, [82] which is that with respect to one common object of vision, in this case a man, many different ways of seeing him arise. This follows, because: an enemy sees him as "enemy"; a friend sees him as "friend"; his son sees him as "father"; his father sees him as "son"; some animals see him as something to drink; others see him as a place to live, and so forth.

Here, one should study the collections of reasonings about the colors white, red, and so forth, that is connected with the colors of the sides of Mt. Meru, the analysis of the five sense objects, and other [preliminary logical reasonings].

1.1.3. A VERSE FOR MEDITATORS.

There is the whole variety of impure things that appear to
the beings in the six realms,
And also the pure appearances of deities and
Buddhafi elds.
However, if you realize that fundamentally, none of these
things exist,
You will realize the expanse of equality, free from all
conceptual elaborations.

It is also said like that.

1.2. AN ANALYSIS OF THE REASONS WHY THIS VARIETY OF APPEARANCES IS SEEN.

1.2.1. The common explanation.

1.2.2. The extraordinary explanation.

1.2.1. THE COMMON EXPLANATION.

1.2.1.1. DEFINITIONS.

- i) That which produces is the cause.
- ii) That which is produced is the result.
- iii) That which produces a specific result directly is the direct cause.
- iv) That which produces a specific result indirectly, [through a chain of occurrences], is the indirect cause.
- v) That which is directly produced by a direct cause is the direct result. [83]
- vi) That which is indirectly produced [through a chain of occurrences] is the indirect result.

vii) **The Six Causes.**

___a) The productive cause of [a composite phenomenon] is a phenomenon that is different from that composite phenomenon.

b) Coemergent causes are composite phenomena that arise together and act as causes and results of each other.

c) A cause of a similar outcome is a phenomenon that gives rise to a like phenomenon in the future.

d) Congruent causes are the primary minds and mental formations that come together in whichever way is appropriate and are congruent with each other in terms of five factors: support, focus, aspect, time, and substance.

e) Omnipresent causes are common factors given up on the path of seeing that have the phenomena of the mental afflictions as their specific result.

f) Causes of the fully ripened result are phenomena that are either nonvirtuous or virtuous in a defiled way, and that have the capacity to produce a fully ripened result.

As is stated in the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,¹⁴

That which is different from a composite phenomenon is
its "productive cause";

Those that act as cause and result back and forth [for each other] are "coemergent causes";

¹⁴ Vol. I, p.240.

An earlier phenomenon that produces a like phenomenon
in the future is a "cause of a similar outcome";
[Primary] minds and mental formations are five-fold
"congruent causes";
Phenomena that are mental afflictions are "omnipresent
causes";
Nonvirtue and defiled virtue are "causes of the fully
ripened result". [84]

viii) The Five Results

a) The fully ripened result arises in a particular sentient being's stream of being after the "cause of the fully ripened result" [has arisen there].

b) A result concordant with its cause arises from either a "cause of a similar outcome" or an "omnipresent cause", whichever is appropriate, and is of a like type [with its cause].

c) A freedom result is the cessation achieved with the power of discriminating analysis; it is the exhaustion that occurs when prajñā has abandoned [everything] to be abandoned.

d) A result brought about by an individual is a result that arises due to the power of any given cause, and whose arising and attainment come about due to the activity of an individual being.

e) Owned results arise from entities or composite phenomena that are merely unhindering to their arising. They are not past; they arise in both the present *and* the future.

As is stated in the same text,¹⁵

What is neutral, unobscuring, and arises in an
[individual's] stream of being after its cause [has
arisen] is a "fully ripened result".

What is of a like type with a "cause of a similar outcome"
or an "omnipresent cause" is a "result concordant with
its cause".

A cessation due to wisdom's power is a "freedom result".

What is attained due to the power of a cause is a "caused result".

The composite phenomenon that arises from non-hindering
entities is an "owned result".

¹⁵ Vol. I, p.242.

ix) The Four Conditions

a) The causal condition is whichever is suitable of the [following] five causes (which exclude the productive cause): coemergent cause; congruent cause; cause of a similar outcome; omnipresent cause; and cause of the fully ripened result. [85]

b) The immediately preceding condition is that which immediately after it is produced gives way to its specific result, uninterrupted by a [primary mind or mental formation] that is similar and congruent to it.¹⁶

c) The focal condition is whatever composite or uncomposite phenomenon is suitable to be the object of one of the six consciousnesses.

d) The dominant condition is any phenomenon that does not obstruct the arising of a composite phenomenon that is different from itself.

For as is stated in the same text,¹⁷

The five causes, excluding the productive cause, are
"causal conditions".

Mind and [mental formations] that immediately after
they are produced give way to their results are
"immediately preceding conditions".

Phenomena that are suitable to be objects of the six
consciousnesses are "focal conditions".

That which does not obstruct arising is the "dominant
condition".

1.2.1.2. REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS.

i) Should someone say, "If it is a cause, it is necessarily the cause of a fully ripened result," then the answer is, "It would then follow that given a congruent cause, it is a cause of a fully ripened result, because it is a cause."

Should the proponent claim, "The reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because it is one of the six causes," and so forth, there being many valid reasons that establish this point.

Should the proponent now accept the answering proposition, the answer to that is, "Given a congruent cause, it is not a cause of a fully ripened result, because it is neither nonvirtue nor defiled virtue, whichever is suitable, with the power to produce a fully ripened result," and so forth, this point being

¹⁶ In other words, nothing comes along and interrupts in between the immediately preceding condition and its result.

¹⁷ Vol. I, p.244.

established in stages with other valid reasons. [86]

ii) Should someone say, "If it is a result, it is definitely a freedom result," then the answer is, "It would then follow that given a fully ripened result, it is a freedom result, because it is a result."

Should the proponent claim, "The reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because it is the result that arises from a cause of a fully ripened result," and so forth, this point being proven in stages.

Should the proponent now accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given a fully ripened result, it is not a freedom result, because it is not the cessation that is attained through the power of discriminating analysis," and so forth, this point being proven in stages.

iii) Should someone say, "If it is a condition, it is definitely an immediately preceding condition," then the answer is, "It would then follow that given a focal condition, it is an immediately preceding condition, because it is a condition."

Should the proponent claim, "The reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because a focal condition is one of the four conditions."

Should the proponent now accept the answering proposition, the answer is, "Given a focal condition, it is not an immediately preceding condition, because it is not that which, immediately after it is produced, gives way to its specific result, uninterrupted by a [primary mind or mental formation] that is similar and congruent to it," and so forth, this point being proven in stages.

iv) Should someone say, "If it is activity that produces cyclic existence, it is definitely negative activity," then the answer is, "It would then follow that given defiled virtuous activity, it is negative activity, because it gives rise to cyclic existence."

Should the proponent claim, "The reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because as a result of defiled virtuous activity, one takes rebirth in the higher realms." And there is pervasion, [87] because if one takes rebirth in one of the three higher realms due to affliction (*kleśa*)-inspired activity, one is definitely a sentient being in cyclic existence.

Should the proponent now accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given defiled virtuous activity, it is not negative activity, because it does not have the defining characteristics of negative activity. This follows, because: it is not something that the excellent ones give up, nor is its fully ripened result unpleasant; and, it is something that the excellent ones adopt, whose fully ripened result is pleasing." And there is pervasion, because these two [negative activity and defiled virtuous activity] are contradictory to each other.

v) Given the five results, there is a way that the six causes produce them, because: the fully ripened result arises from the cause of the fully ripened result, the owned result arises from the productive cause; the result concordant with its cause arises from a cause of a similar outcome or an omnipresent cause and a result brought about by an individual arises from a coemergent cause or a congruent cause.

For as is stated in the same text,¹⁸

Fully ripened [from the last]; owned result [from] the first;
Concordant with its cause from the third and fifth; the
second and fourth are the causes of a result brought
about [by an individual].

1.2.2. THE EXTRAORDINARY EXPLANATION OF CAUSES AND CONDITIONS.

1.2.2.1. Definitions.

1.2.2.1.1. The three common explanations of the Great Vehicle.

1.2.2.1.2. The extraordinary assertions of the glorious Third Karmapa, Rangjung Dorje.

1.2.2.1.3. The special explanation of the tradition of the Great Perfection (*rdzogs chen*).

1.2.2.1.1. THE THREE COMMON EXPLANATIONS OF THE GREAT VEHICLE. [88]

1.2.2.1.1.1. The way the twelve dependently arisen links spin [beings through the cycle of existence (*saṃsāra*)].

1.2.2.1.1.2. The way the eight collections of consciousnesses spin [beings through the cycle of existence].

1.2.2.1.1.3. The way [beings'] three habitual tendencies confuse them.

1.2.2.1.1.1. THE WAY THE TWELVE DEPENDENTLY ARISEN LINKS SPIN [BEINGS THROUGH THE CYCLE OF EXISTENCE].

The power of ignorance activates the twelve dependently arisen links, and in this way [beings] spin through the cycle of existence. This is the definition of the first way in which the cycle of existence turns, for as is stated in the same text,¹⁹

Cyclic life and actions do not truly exist,
However, completely falsely,²⁰ there is dependent
arising due to causes and conditions.

¹⁸ Vol. 1, p.243.

¹⁹ Vol. I, p.252.

²⁰ *Kun rdzop bden pa* is frequently translated as "relative truth". It is translated here as "completely false truth," following Khenpo Tsültrim Gyamtso Rinpoche's oral explanation of *rdzop* as meaning *rdzun ma*, or "false", the definitions of the two truths given in this volume (Section 7.2.1., viii and ix), and Jamgön Kongtrül's detailed explication of the term's etymology in the *Treasury of Knowledge*, Vol. III, pp. 26-41. For an English translation of this section, see *Gaining Certainty about the Provisional and Definitive Meanings in the Three Turnings of the Wheel of Dharma, the Two Truths, and Dependent Arising*, Marpa Institute for Translation, Kathmandu, 1997, pp.50-89.

Thus, the wheel of the twelve links continually turns.

**1.2.2.1.1.2. THE WAY THE EIGHT COLLECTIONS OF CONSCIOUSNESSES
SPIN [BEINGS THROUGH THE CYCLE OF EXISTENCE].**

Because beings do not recognize the true nature of reality, the eight collections of consciousnesses move or turn [saṃsāra's wheel]. For as is stated in the same text,²¹

The beginningless true nature of mind is unimpeded
emptiness and clarity.
This is not recognized, so the mind [filled with] formations
Stirs up [the all-base consciousness], causing dualistic
appearances of perceived and perceiver to arise.
Then the [six] consciousnesses arise, and feeling develops from favoring or rejecting [the six
consciousnesses'
objects]. Discriminations [arise] that perceive [that
these objects have] different characteristics.
Mental formations' [strong] conceptions create the
aggregate of form.
[Then,] craving and grasping [arise], and these links turn saṃsāra's wheel. [89]

1.2.2.1.1.3. THE WAY [BEINGS'] THREE HABITUAL TENDENCIES CONFUSE THEM.

Due to the three habitual tendencies, places, [perceiving] subjects, and bodies appear, and in this manner the cycle of existence turns.

For as is stated in the same text,²²

In short, three habitual tendencies imprinted in the all-
base consciousness
Cause three types of confused appearances to arise:
object, subject, and body.
[The tendency to perceive objects causes the] external
world and the five objects of [the senses], form and so forth, [to appear].
In the eight collections of consciousnesses, [intention
arises] and virtuous and negative actions are
performed [as a result].
[The tendency to perceive bodies causes] objects, agents,

²¹ Vol. I, p.254.

²² Vol. I, pp.255-6.

and actions [in relation to] the six kinds of beings [to appear].
[As the power of these three habitual tendencies grows, confused appearances] of perceived and perceiver [arise], and from [favoring and rejecting these appearances], the mental afflictions are born.
Such is the beginningless and endless cycle of existence.

1.2.2.1.2. THE EXTRAORDINARY ASSERTIONS OF THE GLORIOUS THIRD KARMAPA, RANGJUNG DORJE.

The mind's true nature, its clarity, and the play of its creative power are not recognized, and therefore the cycle of existence turns.

For as the Karmapa stated in the *Profound Inner Meaning*,²³

The cause: the mind itself
Has never, ever been biased or partial,
But its emptiness of essence, its natural clarity,
Its unimpededness in all aspects, its arising as everything—
One is unaware that these are [the mind's] true nature.

1.2.2.1.3. THE SPECIAL EXPLANATION OF THE TRADITION OF THE GREAT PERFECTION.

According to the tradition of the Great Perfection, the appearances of cyclic existence and of the transcendence of suffering (nirvāṇa) arise in the following way: the ground's appearances spontaneously arise from itself in the forms of the eight gates. [90]

As is stated in the [*Precious Treasury of Knowledge*],²⁴

The spontaneity of the ground manifests as eight gates.²⁵

[Finally], and ancillary to the above, there is the way that cyclic existence can be halted: when ignorance, the nonrecognition of the true nature of reality and [cyclic existence's] root cause, ceases, the twelve dependently arisen links come to a halt, one after the other, and peace, the transcendence of suffering, is attained.

²³ {zab mo nang don}

²⁴ Vol. I, p.261.

²⁵ Quoted directly from the translation in *Myriad Worlds: Buddhist Cosmology in Abhidharma, Kālacakra, and Dzogchen*, Snow Lion, Ithaca, NY, 1995. p.209.

As is stated in the same text,²⁶

The reverse progression of the dependently arisen [links
begins when] the link of cause and condition²⁷ is
destroyed.

When this happens, confusion is finished and one perfectly
connects with the supreme liberation.

**1.2.2.2. SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY ENGAGE IN REASONING
CAN UNDERSTAND THINGS EASILY,
HERE ALL REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS ARE GATHERED TOGETHER.**

i) Should someone say, "Íśvara created the world and its inhabitants," then the answer is, "Given the world and its inhabitants, they were not created by Íśvara or any other, because if Íśvara were permanent, he would not perform any activity, and if Íśvara were impermanent, he too would need a creator."

In this way, and as is done in the great texts of the Middle Way and Valid Cognition traditions, the great waves of reasoning must be unleashed [on such a belief].

ii) And others might say, "The world and its inhabitants did not arise from action, [cause, and result], because they just arose naturally." Here, the answer is, "Given the world and its inhabitants, they did not arise without any cause, because if they did not need a cause, it would follow that they would either always exist or never exist." And further, [91] "It would then follow that the effort that people put into arranging and gathering the causes together in order to produce a specific result would be pointless."²⁸

1.2.2.3. A VERSE FOR MEDITATORS

It is also said,

Like that, there are the various impure kinds of activity
and mental affliction,
And also the pure accumulations of merit and wisdom.
However, in the true nature none of these things have

²⁶ Vol. I, p.257.

²⁷ Here the "cause" of cyclic existence is clinging to the belief in a self, while the "condition" that helps to bring cyclic existence about is sentient beings' innate ignorance of the true nature of reality (*lhen cig skyes pa'i ma rig pa*). Vol. II, p.257.

²⁸ Here, the classic example is that of the farmer who plants in the spring so that she might harvest in the fall. If things just happened without any reliance on causes and conditions, her efforts would be pointless.

ever existed,
So just rest yourself, free of speculation, in the
primordially pure expanse.

Like this, the chapter closes with a summarizing verse from those who reside in the Middle Way.

2. AN ANALYSIS OF HOW THE TEACHER WHO TAMED [THE BEINGS] IN THOSE REALMS APPEARED.

- 2.1. An analysis of how [the Buddha] gave rise to the supreme awakening mind (*byang chub kyi sems, bodhicitta*).
- 2.2. An analysis of how in the interim, [the Buddha] conducted [Himself as a bodhisattva].
- 2.3. An analysis of how [the Buddha] manifested [His] enlightenment.
- 2.4. A verse for meditators.

2.1. AN ANALYSIS OF HOW [THE BUDDHA] GAVE RISE TO THE SUPREME AWAKENING MIND

i) Someone may say, "If it is the way that the Teacher gave rise to the awakening mind, then there must be one and only one way that this happened." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, there is not only one way that this happened, because there are the explanations of giving rise to the awakening mind in the Foundational Vehicle, the Great Vehicle, and most extraordinarily in the tradition of the Great Perfection."

The first reason is a quality of the subject, because according to the Foundational Vehicle, at the time [the Buddha] was the King Endowed with Light (*rgyal po 'od lden*), He gave rise to the awakening mind for three reasons.²⁹ Again in Vaishali (*yangs pa'i grong*), at the time [He was] the potter Spacious Light (*yangs pa'i 'od*), He went before the Buddha Mahāśākyamuni and gave rise to the awakening mind. [92] Finally, when He was the universal monarch Supreme of the Gods (*lhag pa'i lha*), He went before the Buddha Brahmādeva (*tshangs pa'i lha*) and gave rise to the awakening mind.

As is stated in the same text,³⁰

Furthermore, according to the Foundational Vehicle,
First, for three reasons he gave rise to the supreme mind
as the King Endowed with Light.
Then, when He saw Mahāśākyamuni and Brahmādeva,
He gave rise to [the supreme mind] again, and thus the
first immeasurable kalpa began.

²⁹ The Buddha described these three reasons to Ānanda in the Vinaya teachings: first, He heard that Buddhas were free from desire; second, He saw that even though elephants are proud and mighty beasts, they still suffer tremendously; and third, He saw that everything in the world turns into suffering. *Treasury of Knowledge*, Vol. I, p.279.

³⁰ Vol. I, p.278.

The second reason is also a quality of the subject, for as is said in the *Sutra of the White Lotus of Compassion*,³¹ when [He] was the son of King Wheel-rim Maker (*rtsibs kyi mu mkhud*) named All-pervading Wind (*khyab 'jug rlung*), he went before the Buddha Ratnagarbha and gave rise to the awakening [mind]; as is said in the *Sutra Returning the Kindness*,³² He first gave rise to the awakening mind at the time He was pulling a wagon in the hot hells; as is said in the *Sutra of the Three Aggregates*,³³ at the time He took birth as a merchant's son named Truly Happy (*mngon dga'*) in reliance on the Thus Gone One named Great Love (*mdzes chen*), He gave rise to the awakening mind; and finally, as is said in the *Sūtra of Great Deeds*,³⁴ in the presence of the Thus Gone One named Seeing the Meaningful (*don yod mthong*), He gave rise to the awakening mind.

As is said in the same text,³⁵

According to the tradition of the Great Vehicle,
The son of the Brahmin Gyamtso Dul attained
Buddhahood and was called Ratnagarbha.

Along with three-hundred trillion other beings, [93]
[The future Śakyāmuni] perfectly gave rise to the
awakening mind.

Then, [He] made five-hundred aspiration prayers to be
born in an era of fighting.

Later, [from Ratnagarbha He] received his prophecy of
[enlightenment].

Furthermore, while a wagon-puller in hell, and before [the Buddha] Seeing the Meaningful, He
gave rise to the awakening mind.

[He later gave] many such accounts.

[Finally,] the third reason is a quality of the subject, because when He was an emanation of the Original Protector Samantabhadra, He offered a golden vajra to the Buddha Flower of Great Beauty, and then gave rise to the awakening mind for the first time. As is said in the same text,³⁶

Then, in order to tame [beings] in this realm,

³¹ {snying rje chen po'i pad ma dkar po'i mdo} *Mahākaruṇāpūṇḍarīkasūtra*.

³² {thabs mkhas pa chen po sang rgyas drin lan bsabs pa'i mdo}

³³ {phung po gsum pa'i mdo} *Triskandhasūtra*.

³⁴ {rgya cher rol pa'i mdo} *Lalitavistarasūtra*.

³⁵ Vol. I, p.279.

³⁶ Vol. I, p.320.

Immeasurable kalpas ago, the emanation skillful in means
Offered a golden vajra to Flower of Great Beauty,
and gave rise to the supreme mind.

ii) Someone may say, "If it is the way that the Teacher, the Buddha, gave rise to the awakening mind, it must be the way that is explained in the tradition of the Great Perfection." The answer to that is, "Given the Great Vehicle's general explanation, it would then follow that it is the explanation of the Great Perfection, because it describes the way that the Teacher gave rise to the awakening mind." Many enumerations of reasons should be used to prove this point. [94]

2.2. AN ANALYSIS OF HOW IN THE INTERIM, [THE BUDDHA] CONDUCTED [HIMSELF AS A BODHISATTVA]

i) Someone may say, "If it is the way that our Teacher conducted Himself while gathering the accumulations on the path, then there must be one and only one way that this happened." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, there is not just one way that this happened, because there are both the Foundational Vehicle's and Great Vehicle's explanations of how this happened."

The first reason is a quality of the subject, because there are both the explanations according to the Vinaya tradition and the Abhidharma tradition. The first of these two reasons is a quality of the subject, because as the Buddha said in the *Vinaya Teachings*,

From the Buddha Śakyāmuni³⁷
Down to [the Buddha] Drenpa Yulkor Kyong,
There were seventy-five thousand Buddhas.
I made offerings to all of them!
I made offerings to the Victorious Ones
Who came during the first immeasurable kalpa.

And further,

From the Buddha Dipankara
Down to the Buddha Wangpo'i Gyaltsen Thupa,
There were seventy-six thousand Buddhas
To whom I made offerings,
All of whom came during the second immeasurable kalpa. [95]

And further,

From the Buddha Lakdze Nezung,
Down to the Buddha Kashyapa

³⁷ Not the Śakyāmuni of our age, but a past Buddha of the same name.

There were seventy-seven thousand Buddhas in the
third immeasurable kalpa
To whom I made offerings.

The second [of these secondary] reason is a quality of the subject, for as is said in the *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge*,³⁸

Vipashyi, Dipankara, Ratnacūda,
These came at the end of the third immeasurable kalpa.
First was Śakyāmuni.

The second of the root reasons is a quality of the subject, for as the Buddha said in the *Avatamsaka sūtra*, "I gathered the accumulations over the course of three immeasurable kalpas"; and in the *Sūtra of Great Deeds*, "I gathered the accumulations over the course of seven immeasurable kalpas"; and in the *Sūtra of the Precious Jewel's Activity*,³⁹ "I gathered the accumulations over the course of many immeasurable kalpas"; and in the *Sūtra of the Bodhisattvas' Grounds*,⁴⁰ [the Buddha] gave two different presentations—at one point, [He] said that because the years, months, days, and moments in each great kalpa were immeasurable, [the kalpas] are called "immeasurable", and at another point, [He said] that because the great kalpas themselves could not be counted, they were called "immeasurable"—in any event, [He gave] many explanations.

As is said in the [*Precious Treasury of Knowledge*]⁴¹

In the Great Vehicle, it is posited that [the Buddha]
[Gathered the accumulations] for three, thirty-three,
and many [immeasurable kalpas], there are
different ways of counting. [96]

Sometimes [the Buddha said] these kalpas started with
His making aspiration prayers, other times with the
great path of accumulation,

And at yet other times, with the attainment of the first
ground: [He had different] intentions [at different
times].

[Sometimes He] taught about how difficult it is to
become enlightened; other times [He taught that a
shorter time was required so that his disciples]

would not be discouraged.

³⁸ {Chos mngon par mdzod} *Abhidharmakośa*.

³⁹ {dkon mchog sprin las} *Ratnameghasūtra*.

⁴⁰ {byang chub sems dpa'i sa'i mdo} *Bodhisattvabhūmisūtra*.

⁴¹ Vol. I, p.285.

[The true nature of] time is inconceivable [suchness, so that He taught different things to different disciples] depending on what they needed [is not contradictory at all].

ii) Someone may say, "If it is the way that our Teacher gathered the accumulations, then it must be the way that the Great Vehicle describes." The answer to that is, "Given the description of this in the Foundational Vehicle, it would then follow that it is the description of the Great Vehicle, because it is the way our Teacher gathered the accumulations."

iii) Someone may say, "If it is the way that our Teacher gathered the accumulations, then it must be the way that the Foundational Vehicle describes." The answer to that is, "Given the description of this in the Great Vehicle, it would then follow that it is the description of the Foundational Vehicle, because it is the way our Teacher gathered the accumulations."

iv) Someone may say, "If it is the way that our Teacher gathered the accumulations, then it must be the way according to the Great Vehicle's common explanation." The answer to that is, "Given the extraordinary unsurpassable secret mantra's description of this, it would then follow that it is the Great Vehicle's common explanation, because it is the way our Teacher gathered the accumulations."

And so forth, all of these being established with reasoning.

2.3. AN ANALYSIS OF HOW [THE BUDDHA] MANIFESTED [HIS] ENLIGHTENMENT.

2.3.1. The main analysis of where the Buddha became enlightened.

2.3.2. The ancillary analysis of where the Buddha became enlightened.

2.3.1. THE MAIN ANALYSIS OF WHERE THE BUDDHA BECAME ENLIGHTENED.

i) Should someone say, "If it is the way the Buddha manifested enlightenment, it can only be the way that the Great Vehicle describes," then the answer is, "Given that as the subject, it is not necessarily the way that the Great Vehicle describes, because there are the explanations according to the Hearers' (śravakas) Foundational Vehicle, the Great Vehicle, and the Secret Mantra Vajrayāna." [97]

The first reason is a quality of the subject because of the following. After gathering the accumulations for three immeasurable kalpas, [the future Buddha Śākyamuni] offered poetic praises to the Buddha Kargyal for seven days without interruption. By this action He accumulated the equivalent of nine kalpas of merit. At the time of His final birth as Prince Siddhārtha, although He had perfected the accumulations of three immeasurable kalpas, all of this was just the support for the great path of accumulation. So at dusk beneath the Bodhi tree, He pacified three hundred-seventy million of Māra's hordes, and manifested the enlightenment that held within it the knowledge that the mental afflictions were exhausted and would never arise again.

The second reason is a quality of the subject, because firstly, some assert that the account given in the Great Vehicle is very similar to the one given in the Hearers' [Vehicle]. Secondly, as the Buddha stated in the *Sūtra of the Father Meeting the Son*,⁴² "Innumerable kalpas ago, before the Thus Gone One named Peak of Faculties, I demonstrated enlightenment and other [deeds]. After that, I again demonstrated [countless] inconceivable awakenings over the course of [many] kalpas. Even now, I am manifesting enlightenment, and I will continue to do so until the cycle of existence is completely empty."

And as he stated in the *Sūtra of the White Lotus of Compassion*,

Oh son of a noble family, hundreds of millions of billions
of kalpas ago, I manifested perfect awakening.

And in the *Travel to Lanka Sūtra*,⁴³

[I] gave up the home of my father Śuddhodanah, however,
[98]

The supreme abode of the Highest Pure Land, where the mind is happy,
Is where the actual Buddha awakened.
An emanation is what awakened here [in this world].

The Buddha spoke in such a way many times.

[Finally], the third reason is a quality of the subject. In the tradition of the Action Tantra, first [He] gave rise to the awakening mind, and then received teachings about the Secret Mantra[yāna] in the presence of the Thus Gone One named Flower who Teaches All (*me tog kun tu ston pa*). Then He practiced mantric conduct, and gathered the accumulations for three immeasurable kalpas. Then He descended from the realm called Sacred White Flower (*dam pa tok dkar*), took birth as the son of Śuddhodanah, and attained enlightenment.

Furthermore, in the tradition of the Performance Tantra, it is explained that [He] gave rise to the awakening mind, and from practicing mantric conduct, He attained the tenth ground. Then in the Highest Pure Land, in the form of the saṃbhogakāya, He demonstrated the way that enlightenment is attained. In the *Collected Performance Tantras*, it says: the bodhisattva Siddhārtha, while in the place that is the heart of enlightenment (Bodhgaya), received empowerments from all the Buddhas. He then arose from his unmoving meditative state, gave rise to the awakening mind, received empowerments from all the Thus Gone Ones, and manifested perfect enlightenment.

The Master of Learning (*ācārya*) Shakyā Shenyen and others explain that at the time the son of Śuddhodanah was practicing austerities by the side of the river Nauranyajana, the Buddhas entreated Him, and so in the form of the "primordial awareness body", [99] He went to the Highest Pure Land and awakened. Then He once again took the form of a fully-ripened body and as an emanation he

⁴² {yab sras mjal ba'i mdo} *Pitāputrasamāgamanasūtra*.

⁴³ {lang kar gshegs pa'i mdo} *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*.

demonstrated the way that enlightenment is attained.

According to the Master Of Learning Kunga Nyingpo, the Victorious One gave rise to the awakening mind, and then gathered the accumulations over the course of three immeasurable kalpas. He gave rise to all the various samādhis, such as the concentrations and the formless [meditative states]. During His last existence, He received the Buddhas' empowerments and attained enlightenment, all of this happening many kalpas ago. Then, as a member of the Śākya clan, he again demonstrated the way that enlightenment is attained.

In the tradition of the unsurpassable mantra, it is said that in His last existence, He took the form of a bodhisattva, and in the great Highest Pure Land, in reliance upon the direct cause of the profound path, He attained enlightenment as Vajradhara himself. Later, as an emanation body in the land of Magadha of this world, He demonstrated the way that enlightenment is attained. First, He enjoyed the company of a retinue of wives, and [performed] other [deeds], these all being the direct causes of His progressing along the path. Eventually, He perfectly abandoned [all that needed to be abandoned] and realized [all that needed to be realized].

2.3.2. THE ANCILLARY ANALYSIS OF WHERE THE TEACHER BECAME ENLIGHTENED: THE HIGHEST PURE LAND.

Should someone say, "If it is the place where [the Buddha] attained enlightenment, it must be the ultimate Highest Pure Land," then the answer is, "Given that as the subject, it follows that it is not necessarily the ultimate Highest Pure Land, because there are the ultimate Highest Pure Land, the Highest Pure Land of signs, the Highest Pure Land of awareness, the secret Highest Pure Land, the Highest Pure Land of thoughts, [100] and the Highest Pure Land of this world, six in all." As is said in the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,⁴⁴

As for the Highest Pure Land, there is the ultimate Highest
Pure Land, that of signs, awareness, the secret one, the
one of thoughts,
And the one of this world makes six, so Sangye
Sangwa has explained.

There is also an explanation that enumerates three different Highest Pure Lands: the genuine, ultimate Highest Pure Land, the great Highest Pure Land called "Richly Adorned", and the Highest Pure Land that is the realm of the natural nirmanakāya. For as is said in the same text,⁴⁵

The genuine, ultimate Highest Pure Land; the Richly Adorned [realm] of self-appearance;
The natural nirmanakāya's sphere; and the cleansed

⁴⁴ Vol. I, p.297.

⁴⁵ Vol. I, p.298.

realm;
These are the domains of enlightenment's three kāyas,
Longchen Rabjam asserts.⁴⁶

2.4. A VERSE FOR MEDITATORS.

As for the deeds of the Compassionate Teacher,
You can examine them through scripture and
reasoning, in any way you like.
However, if you cannot find their beginning or end,
and you cannot see any mid-point, either,
What else is left besides the expanse free from
elaborations, the Dharmakāya?

It is also said like that.

⁴⁶ If you counted four Highest Pure Lands, you were right! Jamgön Kongtrül begins his commentary to this root verse by saying that there are three Highest Pure Lands, but by the time he gets to the end of his explanation, there are four. Perhaps Longchen Rabjam added the last one in his own explanation, but Jamgön Kongtrül does not make this clear.

3. AN EXAMINATION OF THE TEACHINGS, THE GENUINE DHARMA

- 3.1. Definitions gathered together, so that those who seek mainly to understand can grasp things easily. [101]
- 3.2. Refutations and proofs gathered together, so that those who mainly use reasoning can do so easily.
- 3.3. A concluding and summarizing verse for those who mainly practice, so that they might easily gain realization.

3.1. DEFINITIONS.

- i) Something that possesses its own nature is a dharma.⁴⁷
- ii) That which was spoken by the genuine, perfect Buddha, and which is the antidote for the mental afflictions and suffering is the Genuine Dharma.
- iii) The expressions that excellently teach that which is to be expressed, the three trainings,⁴⁸ are the Dharma of Scripture.
- iv) The practice of the three trainings is the Dharma that is accomplished.
- v) That which teaches what is to be expressed, the three trainings, in a means of expression that is undefiled speech; which is endowed with the three types of valid cognition,⁴⁹ establishing it [as undeceiving]; and whose result is virtuous in the beginning, middle, and end, is the Speech of the Buddha.
- vi) That which was spoken by the Teacher, the Buddha Himself, is the Speech Spoken Directly.
- vii) That which was spoken by another individual through the power of the Buddha's blessing is the

⁴⁷ When this usage of the word is intended, it is generally translated as "phenomenon".

⁴⁸ *bslab pa gsum*— these are: right conduct, taught in the vinaya; meditation, taught in the sūtras; and wisdom, taught in the abhidharma.

⁴⁹ This quality of the Buddha's speech is often referred to as *dpyad pa gsum gyis dag pa'i lung*, or "scriptures found to be pure by the three analyses". Such teachings of the Buddha possess the following qualities, whichever may be appropriate. If the subject of the Buddha's discourse is a manifest phenomenon (*gzhal bya mngon gyur*), then the Buddha's speech is not contradicted by anyone's experience of direct valid cognition. If the Buddha is teaching about a hidden phenomenon (*gzhal bya lkog gyur*), then His teachings are not contradicted by the results of inferential valid cognition. Finally, if the Buddha's subject is an extremely hidden phenomenon (*gzhal bya shin tu lkog gyur*), then nothing the Buddha says at this particular time is contradicted by any of His earlier or later statements.

Speech of Blessing.

- viii) That which the Buddha ordered another individual to compose is the Speech [given] following instructions.
- ix) The perfect words that teach mainly about the training in right conduct are the Vinaya Collection (*piṭaka*).
- x) The perfect words that teach mainly about the training in meditation are the Sūtra Collection.
- xi) The perfect words that teach mainly about the training in wisdom are the Abhidharma Collection.
[102]
- xii) The perfect words that teach the right conduct of vowing [to give up] flawed conduct and teach about the selflessness of the individual are the Foundational Vehicle's Collection.
- xiii) The perfect words that teach the right conduct of performing the benefit of others, and that perfectly reveal the selflessness of phenomena are the Great Vehicle's Collection.
- xiv) The perfect words that teach mainly about the three inner trainings are the Vidyādhāra's⁵⁰ Collection.
- xv) The realization in the mindstream of a Noble one⁵¹ of the truth of cessation and the truth of the path is the Dharma of Realization.
- xvi) The expanse that is free from attachment is the Truth of Cessation.
- xvii) The primordial awareness that is free from desire is the Truth of the Path.
- xviii) The abandonment and realization included in the truth of cessation and the truth of the path that exist in the mindstream of the Buddha is realization perfected.

3.2. REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS.

i) Should someone say, "If it is 'dharma', then it must be the Genuine Dharma," then the answer is, "Given that subject, there is no pervasion, because [the term 'dharma' has each of the following ten meanings, each of which are followed by an illustrating example]—

"1) the term 'dharma' applies to all objects of knowledge, as for example, when it was taught, 'Know all phenomena (*dharmas*) to be like that.'

⁵⁰ *rig 'dzin*, literally meaning "Holder of Awareness".

⁵¹ {'phags pa} *Ārya*. Refers here to the arhats and bodhisattvas who have directly realized emptiness.

"2) 'path', as for example when it was taught, 'Monks! Wrong views are not Dharma. Correct views are the Dharma.'

"3) 'nirvāṇa', for example, when someone says, 'I took refuge in the Dharma.' [103]

"4) 'the object perceived by the mind', for example, 'the source of consciousness (*skye mched, āyatana*) that is a dharma.'

"5) 'merit', for example, 'Together with a retinue of queens and maidens, He enjoyed the dharma.'

"6) 'this life', for example, 'the dharma that the immature hold so dearly.'

"7) 'the perfect words of the Buddha', for example, 'Monks! "Dharma" is like this: the Sūtra collection, the collection of songs....'

"8) 'constant becoming', for example, 'Nor am I beyond the dharma of death and the nature of what death is.'

"9) 'certainty', for example, 'Monks! To take life is not the Dharma. To give up taking life is the Dharma.'

"10) 'tradition', for example, 'a country's dharma' and 'a clan's dharma'."

[The proponent then proceeds to challenge the validity of these ten as definitions of the term "dharma".]

Proponent: "The first reason is not a quality of the subject." Answer: "Yes it is, because [a 'dharma'] is that which possesses its own nature." And this follows, because a dharma has a nature that is either specifically-characterized or generally-characterized.

Proponent: "The second and third reasons are not qualities of the subject."

Answer: "Yes they are, because [Dharma] is what prevents one from falling into saṁsāra."

Proponent: "The fourth reason is not a quality of the subject."

Answer: "Yes it is, because [a dharma] is what holds the mind's [attention]."

Proponent: "The fifth reason is not a quality of the subject."

Answer: "Yes it is, because [Dharma] is what prevents one from falling into the lower realms."

Proponent: "The sixth reason is not a quality of the subject."

Answer: "Yes it is, because [dharma] includes the body or what is in harmony with that."

Proponent: "The seventh reason is not a quality of the subject."

Answer: "Yes it is, because [dharma] holds the meaning that is unmistakable." [104]

Proponent: "The eighth reason is not a quality of the subject."

Answer: "Yes it is, because [dharma] holds the phenomenon that is the cause of becoming."

Proponent: "The ninth reason is not a quality of the subject."

Answer: "Yes it is, because [dharma] is the basis for gaining certainty."

Proponent: "The tenth reason is not a quality of the subject."

Answer: "Yes it is, because dharma is everyone acting in a concordant way."

And so forth, this point being established in stages.

ii) Should someone say, "If it is the Buddha's speech, it must be speech that He spoke directly," then the answer is: "Given the Heart Sūtra, it would then follow that the Buddha spoke it directly, because it is the Buddha's speech." And so forth, this point being established in stages.

iii) Should someone say, "If it is a commentary, it is a commentary whose meaning is correct," then the answer is, "Given the Vedas, which do not teach the correct meaning, and the commentaries of those who propound eternalism and nihilism, which express wrong views, it would then follow that they are commentaries that contain the correct meaning, because they are commentaries. And it follows that they are commentaries, because they are the commentaries of other traditions."

iv) Should someone say, "If it is a commentary, it is a commentary that teaches how to give up the suffering of cyclic existence," then the answer is, "Given a commentary that teaches one how to be malicious, like those that instruct on how to be victorious in battle, or a commentary without loving-kindness, like those that teach one to make offerings of cows and other animals as a religious practice, it would then follow that they are commentaries that teach one how to give up the suffering of cyclic existence, [105] because they are commentaries." And so forth, this point being proven in stages.

v) Should someone say, "If it is a commentary, then it is definitely a commentary that emphasizes practice," then the answer is, "Given the commentaries on poetry and so forth that emphasize listening, and the commentaries on logic and so forth that emphasize debate, they are commentaries that emphasize practice, because they are commentaries." And so forth, this point being proven in stages.

3.3. FOR THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE, A CONCLUDING, SUMMARIZING VERSE SO THAT THEY MIGHT UNDERSTAND THINGS EASILY.

All the vast and profound ways of Dharma that the
Teacher taught,
Are methods for taming thoughts that cling to a self.
So, with profound wisdom, gain certainty in
The selfless true nature, actual reality free from all
conceptual elaborations, and meditate!

4. AN EXAMINATION OF HOW THE VICTORIOUS ONE'S TEACHINGS HAVE GROWN AND FLOURISHED IN THIS WORLD

- 4.1. So that those who mainly wish to understand might grasp the definitions easily, they are taught together in one place.
- 4.2. So that those mainly interested in reasoning might quickly engage in it, the refutations and proofs are taught together.
- 4.3. So that those who mainly want to practice can do so easily, the chapter concludes with a summarizing verse.

4.1. DEFINITIONS [106]

- i) A place where the three collections of scriptures from any of the four turnings [of the wheel of Dharma] are explained and studied, and where the practices of the three trainings of the path are taken up, is a land where the completely pure teachings of the Victorious One flourish.
- ii) A place where the collection of Vinaya teachings from any of the four turnings are explained and studied, and where the practices of the training in right conduct are taken up, is a land where the Vinaya teachings flourish.
- iii) A place where the collection of Sūtra teachings from any of the four turnings are explained and studied, and where the practices of the training in meditation are taken up, is a land where the Sūtra teachings flourish.
- iv) A place where the collection of Abhidharma teachings from any of the four turnings are explained and studied, and where the practices of the training in wisdom are taken up, is a land where the Abhidharma teachings flourish.
- v) A place where the three collections of the Hearers' teachings are explained and studied, and where the three trainings of that tradition are practiced, is a land where the Hearers' teachings flourish.
- vi) A place where the three collections of Great Vehicle teachings are [explained and studied], and where the Great Vehicle's three trainings are practiced, is a land where the Great Vehicle's teachings flourish.
- vii) A place where the collection of Vidyādhāra teachings is [explained and studied], and where the three inner trainings are practiced is a land where the Vajrayāna teachings flourish.

viii) A place where the [above] three's collections of teachings are explained and studied, and where their three trainings are practiced, is a land where the teachings of all three flourish.

ix) A place where the three collections of scriptures are explained and studied, but where the three trainings of the path are not practiced is [107] a land where the teachings of explanation flourish.

x) A place where there is just the practice of the three trainings, and not the explanation or study of the three collections of teachings is a land where the teachings of realization flourish.

xi) A land where the essential explanations of the key points of the three collections and the four tantras are combined and practiced is a land where the practice teachings flourish.

xii) A land where people have given up concern for this life, where worldly activity is abandoned, and where the solitary mountain retreats are full, is a land where the practice teachings so excellently flourish!

4.2. SO THAT THEY MIGHT BE READILY UNDERSTOOD, REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS ARE COLLECTED TOGETHER HERE

i) Should someone say, "If it is a land where the Victorious One's teachings flourish, then it is definitely a land where the Great Vehicle's teachings flourish," then the answer is, "Given a land where only the Foundational Vehicle's teachings flourish, it would then follow that it is a land where the Great Vehicle's teachings flourish, because it is a land where the Victorious One's teachings flourish," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given that subject, it is not a land where the Great Vehicle's teachings flourish, because [followers of the Foundational Vehicle] do not accept the Great Vehicle's teachings in their entirety." This follows, because they do not accept the Sūtra of the Transcendent Perfection of Wisdom in 100,000 stanzas, and so forth, this point being proven in stages.

ii) Should someone say, "If it is a land where the Victorious One's teachings flourish, then it is definitely a land where the Hearers' teachings flourish," then the answer is, "Given a land where only the Great Vehicle's teachings flourish, it would follow that it is that, because of that," and so forth, this point being established in stages. [108]

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given a land where only the Great Vehicle's teachings flourish, it follows that it is not a land where the Hearers' teachings flourish, because it is a land where only the three collections of Great Vehicle teachings and their corresponding three trainings are present," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

iii) Should someone say, "If it is a land where the Victorious One's teachings flourish, then it is definitely a land where the Vajrayāna teachings flourish," then the answer is, "Given a land where only the Great Vehicle teachings flourish, it would follow that it is that, because of that," and so forth, this point being

established in stages.

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given a land where only the Great Vehicle's teachings flourish, it follows that it is not a land where the Vajrayāna teachings flourish, because it is not a land where the Vidyādhāra's collection of teachings are explained and studied, or where the three inner trainings are practiced," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

4.3. IN CONCLUSION, A SUMMARIZING VERSE SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE MAY DO SO EASILY

In a land where the flourishing of the Victorious One's
teachings has left its imprint,
It is necessary to enter the strifeless path of peace.
Therefore, cultivate renunciation, love, and compassion,
And practice according to the words of the Great Sage.⁵²

⁵² {drang srong chen po} *mahāṣhi*.

5. AN ANALYSIS OF HOW TO TRAIN IN RIGHT CONDUCT THAT IS SUPERIOR [109]

- 5.1. So that those who mainly wish to understand might grasp the definitions easily, they are taught together in one place.
- 5.2. So that those mainly interested in reasoning might quickly engage in it, the refutations and proofs are taught together.
- 5.3. So that those who mainly want to practice can do so easily, the chapter concludes with a summarizing verse.

5.1. DEFINITIONS.

- i) Giving up negative conduct or faults is a vow.
- ii) When with a completely pure thought of renunciation [of saṁsāra] as one's intention, one binds⁵³ the negative conduct of the three gates,⁵⁴ that is the vow of individual liberation.
- iii) When with the thought of wanting to attain merely the happiness and comforts of the god and human realms, one binds only the negative conduct of body and speech, that is the right conduct of excellent aspiration.
- iv) When one merely fears both what might happen in this life and the suffering of the lower realms that one might have to experience in later lives, and because of that one binds the negative conduct of the three gates, that is the right conduct that protects one from fear.
- v) When with the intention of loving-kindness and compassion, one [aspires to] attain the state of perfect Buddhahood for the benefit of others, and in order to achieve that goal one gives up the negative conduct of the three gates, that is the Bodhisattva vow.
- vi) The mind that aspires to attain the state of perfect Buddhahood for the benefit of others, before actually taking up the practice [of the transcendent perfections (*pāramitās*)] is the aspiring mind.
- vii) The mind that aspires to attain the state of perfect Buddhahood for the benefit of others, and that has begun to practice [the transcendent perfections] is the mind that has entered [into bodhisattva conduct].

⁵³ *sdom* in Tibetan means both "to bind/tie up" and "to vow", the former definition giving some insight into what the latter one actually means.

⁵⁴ The "three gates" are body, speech, and mind.

viii) When the impure appearances of the three gates are bound by great bliss's primordial awareness, that is the vow of mantra. [110]

ix) When all phenomena that are seen and heard are bound up in the state of natural, innate primordial awareness, that is the vow of mantra's causal tantra.⁵⁵

x) When all coarse and subtle thoughts and characteristics of dualistic appearances are bound up in the yogas of creation and completion stages, that is the vow of mantra's method tantra.

xi) When all phenomena that appear to oneself are bound in the essence of the kāyas and wisdoms, that is the vow of mantra's fruition tantra.

5.2. REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS.

i) Someone may say, "If it is the entity of the vows of individual liberation, which depend for their existence on the perceivable form of the masters and are outwardly imperceptible form, then it is definitely imperceptible form."⁵⁶ The answer is, "Given that subject, your conclusion does not follow, because:

"the Sūtra school (*mdo sde pa*, *Sautrantika*) asserts that [the vow] is something specific that changes the [vow-taker's] *mindstream* [for the better, and so therefore the vow is not *form*];

"according to the Mind-only school, (*sems tsam pa*, *Cittamatra*), [the vow] is an 'abandoning' state-of-mind together with a seed [of a habitual tendency that is planted in the all-base consciousness];

"and according to the Middle Way school (*dbu ma*, *Madhyamaka*), it is an 'abandoning' state-of-mind that is accompanied by congruency," and so forth, this point being established by each of the above reasons.

ii) Should someone say, "if it is giving rise to the awakening mind, then it is definitely giving rise to the awakening mind that enters [into bodhisattva conduct]," then the answer is, "Given the awakening mind of aspiration, it would follow that it is the entering awakening mind, because it is the awakening mind," and so forth, this point being established in stages. [111]

iii) Should someone say, "If it is a mantra vow, then it is definitely the vow of mantra's method tantra," then the answer is, "Given the vow of mantra's fruition tantra, it would then follow that it is that, because of that," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

⁵⁵ The Venerable Dzogchen Pönlop, Rinpoche translates *rGyud* or *tantra* as "continuity", explaining that the distinguishing feature of the Tantric Vehicle is its view that enlightenment is nothing to be achieved, because it is continuously present in every state of mind and in every situation in both saṃsāra and nirvāṇa.

⁵⁶ The Particularist school (*bye brag smra ba*, *Vaibhāṣika*) makes this assertion that a vow is of the nature of form.

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer to that is, "Given the vow of mantra's fruition tantra, it follows that it is not the vow of mantra's method tantra, because it does not bind all coarse and subtle characteristics and thoughts in the yogas of creation and completion stages." This follows, because it is that which binds all phenomena that appear to oneself in the play of the kāyas and wisdoms.

iv) Someone may say, "the individual who is practicing all three vows in her mindstream is practicing them according to the tradition which holds that the [preceding] vow provides the support for the [subsequent] one." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, your conclusion does not follow, because there is the tradition [which holds that] the mind is empty and the vows abide in the mind separately and distinctly, and also the tradition where the vows are said to transform in essence."

Should the proponent claim, "the first reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because [this tradition] maintains that in the sky of that one individual's mindstream, the vow of individual liberation is like the stars, the bodhisattva vow is like the moon, and the mantra vow is like the sun," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

Should the proponent claim, "the second reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because [this tradition's view is as follows]. When you melt down a particular type of stone, you will either get silver, copper, or iron. Then if you apply the alchemist's elixir, all three will transform into gold. Similarly, the vow of individual liberation transforms into the bodhisattva vow, and the bodhisattva vow transforms into the mantra vow," and so forth, this point being established in stages. [112]

5.3. IN CONCLUSION, A SUMMARIZING VERSE SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE MAY DO SO EASILY.

As for the individual liberation, bodhisattva, and mantra
vows—

If you know the precise ways to abandon [the mental afflictions], to transform [them], and to make
[them] into your path,

If you determine well what you need to do and what you
need to stop doing, and if you are skillful in the
method of your practice,

You, Vajrayāna practitioner and holder of the three vows,
will be swiftly liberated.

6. AN EXPLANATION OF HOW TO GIVE RISE TO THE WISDOM THAT COMES FROM LISTENING

- 6.1. An examination of the common reasonings.
- 6.2. An examination of the objects of knowledge that are explained in both the Foundational Vehicle and the Great Vehicle.
- 6.3. An examination of the various views and tenets in the causal vehicle of characteristics.
- 6.4. A brief analysis of the Vajrayāna.

6.1. AN EXAMINATION OF THE COMMON REASONINGS.

6.1.1. SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY WISH TO UNDERSTAND MIGHT
GRASP THE DEFINITIONS EASILY, THEY ARE TAUGHT
TOGETHER IN ONE PLACE.

- i) The field of study that primarily determines connections and contradictions with regard to words is the study of linguistics.
- ii) The field of study that primarily determines connections and contradictions with regard to actual reality is the study of valid cognition.
- iii) That which performs through the manifestations of body, speech, and mind is the study of performance.
- iv) That which heals disturbances in the four elements and prolongs life is the science of healing. [113]
- v) That which one understands or is aware of is an object.
- vi) That which is suitable to be an object of the mind is an object of knowledge.
- vii) That which is realized through valid cognition is an object of comprehension.
- viii) That which has the ability to perform a function is an entity.
- ix) That which does not have the ability to perform a function is a non-entity.
- x) That which arises from its own specific causes and conditions is a composite.
- xi) A phenomenon that does not arise from its own causes and conditions and that does not decay is an uncomposite.

- xii) That which is made of atoms is matter.
- xiii) That which is aware of an object is consciousness.
- xiv) That which is composed of external atoms is external matter.
- xv) That which is composed of internal atoms is internal matter.
- xvi) That which is over, finished, done, is the past.
- xvii) That which has not happened yet, which has not yet come about, is the future.
- xviii) That which exists and has not yet ceased is the present.
- xix) An entity that has many previous and later moments of its own nature is a continuum.
- xx) An entity that does not have any previous or later moments of its own nature is momentary.
- xxi) That which one is aware of because it appears is the appearing object or the perceived object.⁵⁷
- xxii) That which one is aware of because one refers to it in thought is a referent object.
- xxiii) That which is undeceiving when engaged in order to do something or to avoid something else is an engaged object.
- xxiv) That which can actually and genuinely perform a function is a specifically-characterized phenomenon.
- xxv) A phenomenon that cannot actually and genuinely perform a function is a generally-characterized phenomenon.
- xxvi) The object that is realized by direct valid cognition is a manifest comprehended object. [114]
- xxvii) The object realized by inferential valid cognition is a hidden comprehended object.
- xxviii) The object realized in dependence upon scriptures found to be pure by the three analyses⁵⁸ is an extremely hidden comprehended object.

⁵⁷ Although the two terms are listed together, there is in fact a difference between them. The appearing object is the object of both conceptual and non-conceptual consciousnesses, while the latter is only the object of a non-conceptual directly validly cognizing consciousness. So whatever is a perceived object is an appearing object, but whatever is an appearing object is not necessarily a perceived object.

⁵⁸ See footnote 49, above.

xxix) That which is understood by way of signs is an object of expression.

xxx) That which understands or is aware, or which causes understanding or awareness, is the subject.⁵⁹

xxxi) That which causes understanding by way of signs is the means of expression.

xxxii) That which is clear and aware is consciousness.

xxxiii) That which expresses merely the entity of an object is a name.

xxxiv) That which expresses the entity of an object and connects this with a specific attribute [or attributes of the object] is a phrase.

xxxv) That which expresses the specific attribute of an object and connects it with some activity, either engagement or disengagement, is factually-concordant speech.

xxxvi) If the object of expression expressed for a consciousness is a general type, then [the expression is] a term expressing a type.

xxxvii) If the object of expression expressed for a consciousness is a collected mass of the eight particle-substances,⁶⁰ then [the expression] is a term expressing a collection.

xxxviii) That which causes understanding of the object of expression by means of omitting as its own object of expression the [original] object's other specific qualities is a term that expresses a quality.

xxxix) That which causes understanding of the object of expression by means of *not* omitting as its own object of expression the [original] object's other specific qualities is a term that expresses the subject.

xl) A term where the grammatical particle is placed immediately after the specific attribute is a term that eliminates non-possession of [an attribute]. [115]

xli) A term where the grammatical particle is placed immediately after the subject is a term that eliminates other-possessors.

xlii) A term where the grammatical particle is placed immediately after an expression of possibility is a term that eliminates impossibility.

xliii) That which is [only] imputedly existent, [whose existence] is imputed onto the continuum of the collection of the four or five aggregates, is an individual.

⁵⁹ A subject can either be a consciousness (*shes pa*) that understands or a conventional term (*tha snyad*) that causes understanding. Hence the two parts to the definition.

⁶⁰ *rdul rdzas brgyad*. These are earth, water, fire, wind, form, odor, taste, and tangibles.

- xliv) The mind that newly realizes its object is a valid cognizer.
- xlv) The mind that does not newly realize its object is an invalid cognizer.
- xlvi) A mind whose appearing object is definitely a generally-characterized phenomenon is a conceptual [mind].
- xlvii) When there is a consciousness whose appearing object is either a specifically-characterized phenomenon or an object [that appears but has] no foundation, whichever of these two happens to occur, that is a non-conceptual consciousness.
- xlviii) [When the mind] perceives something to be that which it is not, that is a confused consciousness.
- xlix) [When the mind] is aware of the true nature of an object, that is an unconfused consciousness.
- l) That which is aware of the perceiver is self-awareness.
- li) That which is aware of the perceived is other-awareness.
- lii) From amongst the object and the object's specific attributes, that which is aware of just the object is a [primary] mind.
- liii) That which is aware of the object's specific features is a mental formation.
- liv) A non-conceptual, unmistaken awareness is a direct valid cognizer.
- lv) A consciousness that is other-aware, non-conceptual, unmistaken, and that arises directly from its dominant condition (a physical sense faculty) is a sense direct valid cognizer.
- lvi) A consciousness that is other-aware, non-conceptual, unmistaken, and that arises directly from its dominant condition (the mental sense faculty) is a mental direct valid cognizer. [116]
- lvii) That which exists right with all consciousnesses and is the aspect whose perception is only oriented inward, is a self-aware valid cognizer.
- lviii) The non-conceptual, unmistaken consciousness of a Noble one that arises through the power of meditating on actual reality is a yogic direct valid cognizer.
- lix) The mind that newly realizes its object, a hidden [comprehended object], in reliance upon a reason in which the three modes are complete, is an inferential valid cognizer.
- lx) [When phenomena] do not abide in harmony [with each other], that is contradiction.
- lxi) When something different from a phenomenon is eliminated, and that actual phenomenon itself also ceases [to exist], that is connection.

lxii) A phenomenon for whom the arising of its object-generalty depends on the arising of the object-generalty of that which it negates is negation [*or a negative phenomenon*].

lxiii) A phenomenon for whom the arising of its object- generality does not depend on the arising of the object-generalty of that which it negates is establishment [*or a positive phenomenon*].

lxiv) That which pervades many is a generality.

lxv) If you are that [universal] phenomenon, you and that [universal] phenomenon are connected in the same essence, and if there are many others that are not you but *are* that [universal] phenomenon, you are a specific instance [*particular*].

lxvi) A phenomenon that does not arise as "different" to thoughts is one.

lxvii) Phenomena that are understood to be different in terms of their existent bases and actual names are different.

lxviii) That which engages an object through distinguishing parts is an eliminative engager.

lxix) That which engages an object without having distinguished any parts is a collective engager.

lxx) A phenomenon that is realized by words eliminating its object of elimination is an other-eliminator.
[117]

lxxi) That which establishes the isolate of the meaning and eliminates explicit contradictions is the definition.

lxxii) That in which the term and the consciousness which possess the reason are established is the definiendum.

lxxiii) The basis for establishing the connection between the definition and the definiendum is the illustrating example.

lxxiv) That which has the ability to fulfill the needs of beings is a substance.

lxxv) A quality of form that is itself substantially existent is a substantial quality.

lxxvi) A phenomenon that appears to thought as the opposite of its discordant type, and which is not an entity, is a reverse.

lxxvii) A phenomenon that appears to thought as a quality of a substance, and which is not an entity, is a reverse quality.

lxxviii) When the three modes are complete, that is a correct reason.

lxxix) The mode that valid cognition has determined to be, in a corresponding formulation, fully present in all instances of the [flawless] subject in question of the reason to be established, is the subject quality.

lxxx) The mode that valid cognition has determined to be present only in that which corresponds to the predicate in accordance with the mode of the proof in the proof of whatever reason is the forward pervasion.

lxxxi) The mode that valid cognition has determined not to be present in any instance of that which does not correspond to the predicate in accordance with the mode of proof in the proof of whatever reason is the reverse pervasion.

lxxxii) A reason where the three modes are not complete is a pseudo-reason.

lxxxiii) A basis for gaining certainty about the forward pervasion before certainty has been gained about the probandum⁶¹ is a correct concordant example.

lxxxiv) That which is taken to be a basis for gaining certainty about pervasion in order to establish certainty about the probandum, but is unable to provide such certainty, is a pseudo-example.

lxxxv) A proof statement that for both the proponent and opponent brings about certainty and appears in harmony, that has no more or less than the three modes [complete], and that has the two branches of a proof statement, is a correct proof statement. [118]

lxxxvi) That which is a proof statement with a flaw in either the mind, the meaning, or a term, and so is contradictory to the three modes, is a pseudo-proof statement.

lxxxvii) What is understood in reliance upon a correct reason is the probandum of a correct reason.

lxxxviii) A pseudo-proposition whose opposite is proven by valid cognition is a proposition to be eliminated.

lxxxix) Speech that points out a flaw in [an opponent's argument], and that enables one to understand that [the argument] is indeed flawed is correct criticism.

xc) Speech that [attempts to] point out a flaw [in an opponent's argument], but which is unable to cause one to understand that [the argument] is indeed flawed is pseudo-criticism.

xc i) A statement of a consequence that an answer cannot refute is a correct consequence.⁶²

xc ii) A statement of a consequence that an answer can refute is a pseudo-consequence.

⁶¹ i.e., that which is to be proven.

⁶² *Thal 'gyur*, here translated as "consequence", is frequently translated into its Latin equivalent, *reductio ad absurdum*.

xciii) An individual making an assertion who is able to present the original thesis is the proponent.

xciv) An individual making an assertion who criticizes the original thesis is the opponent.

xcv) An individual making an assertion who determines whom is the winner and whom is the loser in a debate is the judge.

**6.1.2. SO THAT THOSE MAINLY INTERESTED IN REASONING
MIGHT QUICKLY ENGAGE IN IT,
THE REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER.**

i) Should someone say, "If it is a field of study, it is definitely the study of valid cognition," the answer is, "Given the study of linguistics, it would then follow that it is that, because of that."

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given the study of linguistics [119], it follows that it is not the study of valid cognition, because it does not determine connections and contradictions with regard to actual reality. This follows, because it is the study that determines connections and contradictions with regard to words," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

ii) Should someone say, "If it is an appearing object, it is definitely a specifically-characterized phenomenon," then the answer is, "Given the object that appears to conceptual [mind], it would then follow that it is a specifically-characterized phenomenon, because it is an appearing object. This follows, because from [its] appearing to thought, [the mind] became aware of it."

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given the object that appears to conceptual mind, it follows that it is not a specifically-characterized phenomenon, because it is a generally-characterized phenomenon. This follows, because it is an other-eliminator," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

iii) Should someone say, "If it is an object, it is definitely a referent object," then the answer is, "Given a direct valid cognizer's appearing object, it would then follow that it is that, because of that."

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given a direct valid cognizer's appearing object, it follows that it is not a referent object, because the mind is not made aware of it through referring to it in thought," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

iv) Should someone say, "If it is a correct reason, it is definitely a correct negating reason," then the answer is, "Given a correct result reason, it would then follow that it is that, because of that."

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given that subject, it follows that it is not a correct negating reason, because it is not that which possesses the three modes in regard to negating an object of negation. This follows, because it is a reason that possesses the three modes of a result." [120]

v) Should someone say, "If it is an eliminating term, it is definitely a term that eliminates non-possession of an attribute," the answer is, "Given a term that eliminates other-possession, it would follow that it is that, because of that."

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given a term that eliminates other-possession, it follows that it is not a term that eliminates non-possession of an attribute, because it is not a term where the grammatical particle is placed immediately after the specific attribute. This follows, because it is a term where the grammatical particle is placed immediately after the subject," and so forth, this point being proven in stages.

vi) Should someone say, "If it is an eliminating term, it is definitely a term that eliminates impossibility," the answer is, "Given that subject, it follows that there is no pervasion, because there are the term that eliminates non-possession and the term that eliminates other-possession."

"The first reason is established, because there is a term where the grammatical particle is placed immediately after the specific attribute. The second reason is established, because there is a term where the grammatical particle is placed immediately after the subject."

And so forth, and you should analyze how each of the above definitions are established with limitless numbers of reasons.

6.1.3. IN CONCLUSION, A SUMMARIZING VERSE SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE MAY DO SO EASILY.

The various subjects of the common fields of study
Are taught for temporary purposes, however,
The true nature is free of all concepts,
And those intelligent ones who know well how to enter it will be swiftly liberated. [121]

**6.2. OBJECTS OF KNOWLEDGE THAT ARE EXPLAINED IN BOTH THE
FOUNDATIONAL VEHICLE AND THE GREAT VEHICLE.**

**6.2.1. SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY WISH TO UNDERSTAND
MIGHT GRASP THE DEFINITIONS EASILY, THEY ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER IN ONE PLACE.**

- i) When many are collected together, that is an aggregate.
 - ii) That which is suitable to be form is form.
 - iii) The collection of many [entities] suitable to be form is the aggregate of form.
 - iv) The mental formation that has the nature of experience is feeling.
 - v) The collection of many mental formations that have the nature of experience is the aggregate of feeling.
 - vi) The mental formation that apprehends characteristics is discrimination.
 - vii) The collection of many mental formations that apprehend characteristics is the aggregate of discrimination.
 - viii) A mental formation that has the nature of movement [around the object] is a mental formation.
 - ix) The collection of mental formations that have the nature of movement [around the object] is the aggregate of mental formation.
 - x) That which is aware of an object is consciousness.
 - xi) The collection of many of those that are aware of an object is the aggregate of consciousness.
 - xii) The door for the arising and spreading of consciousness is a source of consciousness (*skyes mched, āyatana*). [122]
 - xiii) The dominant condition of the arising and spreading of the eye consciousness is the eye consciousness-source.
- This method of definition should be applied to the other [five pairs of] sources of consciousness.
- xiv) That which possesses its own characteristics is a potential.⁶³

⁶³ *Khams, dhātu*; translated here as "potential" following Mipham Rinpoche's description of these eighteen as having the "potential" to produce consciousness, just as that which in the seed has the ability to produce a sprout is the seed's "potential". See Mipham Rinpoche's commentary on the *dbus dang mtha' rnam par 'byed pa'i bstan bcos*, called *'od zer phreng ba*, p.718).

xv) That which possesses the characteristic of being the dominant condition for the arising of the eye consciousness is the eye potential.

xvi) That which possesses the characteristic of being the focal condition of the arising of the eye consciousness is the form potential.

xvii) That which possesses the characteristic of being the consciousness that arises from the dominant condition of the eye sense faculty and that is aware of form is the eye sense consciousness potential.

This method of definition should be applied to the other [five trios] of potentials.

xviii) Existence in dependence upon causes and conditions is dependent arising.

xix) That which arises in sequence due to the power of ignorance and circles [over and over again] is the dependent arising of cyclic existence.

**6.2.2. SO THAT THOSE MAINLY INTERESTED IN REASONING
MIGHT QUICKLY ENGAGE IN IT,
THE REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER.**

i) Someone may say, "The ways of classifying the bases of classification, the body and mind, into aggregates, sources of consciousness, and potentials is meaningless." The answer to that is, "Given the divisions into aggregates, sources of consciousness, and potentials, they are not meaningless, because: they are antidotes for the three types of ignorance; they are presented because there are [beings] with three different levels of intellectual facility; and they are presented because [beings] have three different levels of interest." [123]

Should the proponent claim, "The first reason is not a quality of the subject," then the answer is, "Yes it is, because: the division into the five aggregates is the remedy for taking the mind to be one solid thing [and therefore for taking it to be the self]; the division into the twelve sources of consciousness is the remedy for taking form to be one solid thing [and therefore for taking it to be the self]; and the division into the eighteen potentials is the remedy for taking both the mind and body to be the self."

Should the proponent claim, "The second reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because those with the highest faculties do not need many divisions to be able to understand things, so the division into the five aggregates was made for them; the division into the twelve sources of consciousness was made for those with middling faculties; and the division into the eighteen potentials was made for those with the lowest faculties."

Should the proponent claim, "The third reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because for those interested in having only a few divisions, the [Buddha presented] the division into five aggregates; for those interested in a medium number of divisions, [He presented] the twelve sources of consciousness; and for those who like extensive [explanations, He presented] the division into eighteen potentials," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

ii) Should someone say, "The explanation that uses the classifications of the twelve links of dependent arising was given only to explain how it is that the cycle of existence turns," the answer is, "Given the presentation of the twelve links of dependent arising, it follows that it was not made just for that purpose alone, because it was made for the purpose of refuting the existence of some other creator or agent, and also because it is necessary to refute [the belief] that things arise without any cause. This follows, because the natural result of a good understanding of the presentation of the twelve links of dependent arising is that one will no longer believe in the existence of some other creator or agent, and also that one will not believe that things arise causelessly. [124]

iii) Given the explanation of the reverse progression of [the twelve links] of dependent arising, there is a need for it, because when the wisdom that realizes egolessness cuts through ego-clinging, which is the root of cyclic existence, one is liberated from the bondage of existence, and one attains the transcendence of suffering.

6.2.3. IN CONCLUSION, A SUMMARIZING VERSE SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE MAY DO SO EASILY.

Like that is a summary of the classifications of the
aggregates, sources of consciousness, potentials, and
dependent arising.
If you become learned and realize their [meaning],
Your reasoning will show up the referent object of the
view of self for what it is,
And you will undoubtedly pull up ego-clinging from the
root.

6.3. AN EXAMINATION OF THE VARIOUS VIEWS AND TENETS IN THE CAUSAL VEHICLE OF CHARACTERISTICS.

6.3.1. DEFINITIONS.

i) "That to which you are carried," and "that which carries you," whichever is appropriate, are the definitions of a vehicle.⁶⁴

ii) The means by which those who are motivated by renunciation can attain their goal of total and one-sided peace is the Foundational Vehicle.

iii) That which has: the view of the selflessness of the individual; the meditation on the sixteen aspects of the four noble truths, such as impermanence [and so forth]; the conduct of taking on whichever of the seven types of individual liberation vows⁶⁵ are appropriate, motivated by the desire for one's own peace and happiness; and which is the means of attaining the fruition of Arhathood with and without remainder is the Vehicle of the Excellent Hearers.

[What follows is Jamgön Kongtrül's explanation from the *Treasury of Knowledge*⁶⁶ of the sixteen aspects of the four noble truths.

[The four aspects of the truth of suffering are: whatever is composite is impermanent; whatever is impermanent is of the nature of suffering; whatever is suffering is empty; and whatever is empty is selfless.

[These four are the remedies for believing in permanence, happiness, "me", and "mine".

[The four aspects of the truth of the origin of suffering are: mental afflictions and the actions defiled by them are the cause of the habitual tendencies that give rise to the next life; the accumulation of the habitual tendencies of actions is the cause for the beings within each of the six realms to be similar in type and mode of appearance, so this accumulation is the origin; mental afflictions and defiled actions are the definitive causes for the certain and unique rebirth of each individual in a specific realm and specific place of birth; and mental afflictions and defiled actions are the conditions for getting one saṃsāric body instead of another, and for going from one body to another at a specific time.

[These four are the remedies for believing: that things happen for no reason at all; that they happen for

⁶⁴ The first definition is that of the resultant vehicle, the path of fruition. It refers to the Vajrayāna, the extraordinary Great Vehicle. The second definition is that of the causal vehicle, the causal path. It refers to the Foundational Vehicle and the common Great Vehicle.

⁶⁵ The seven categories of the vows of individual liberation are: men and women lay practitioners (*dge bsnyen pa/ma*); those men and women who have left home but are not fully ordained (*dge tshul pa/ma*); fully ordained monks and nuns (*dge slongs pa/ma*); and women who aspire to full ordination (*dge slob ma*).

⁶⁶ Vol. II, pp.461-4.

only one reason; that the reason things happen to beings is not directly the result of their own actions; and that things happen to beings because of someone's intention that they do.

[The four aspects of the truth of cessation are: the cessation that is the absence of the mental afflictions that are the cause of suffering; the peace that is the freedom from the suffering of composite phenomena and the appropriated aggregates; the excellence that is the purity of the freedom from the mental afflictions and the happiness of the freedom from suffering; and the definite emergence that is the irreversible abandonment of cyclic existence, the permanent and ultimate virtue that forms the basis for benefitting others.

[These are the remedies for believing: that there is no liberation; that suffering is liberation; that the bliss of [saṃsāric] meditative states is excellent; and that liberation is not continuous.

[The four aspects of the truth of the path are: it is the path that searches for and causes realization of the dharmadhātu, suchness; it is appropriate because it becomes the remedy for the mental afflictions, which are inappropriate; it achieves, because it reverses wrong views, like the belief that composite phenomena are permanent, and so forth, because it causes realization of suchness, and because it establishes the unmistaken mind; and it delivers one to the uncomposite, permanent and continual transcendence of suffering.

[Meditating on these is the remedy for believing: that there is no path; that the path is evil; that there is also another path; and that this path too is wrong.][125-6]⁶⁷

iv) The means of attaining the fruition of [one-sided] nirvāṇic peace that is based on the Hearers' Vehicle and focuses on the profound meditation on dependent arising is the Solitary Realizers' (pratyekabuddha) Vehicle.

v) That which has extraordinary realization of the view [of the two kinds of selflessness]; is extraordinary in that motivated by loving-kindness and compassion, its followers] train in the application of the [six transcendent perfections]; is extraordinary in its abandoning of [both the afflictive and cognitive obscurations (*nyon mongs kyi sgrib pa, shes bya'i sgrib pa*)]; is extraordinary in its [use of profound wisdom and vast skill in means to attain the state of nirvāṇa that abides neither in existence nor in peace]; and which has the seven extraordinary qualities⁶⁸ is the extraordinary Great Vehicle.

⁶⁷ Because the order of the definitions has been modified slightly from the Tibetan version, what follows are the definitions given both on page 125 and on page 126.

⁶⁸ These seven extraordinary qualities were explained by Lord Maitreya in the *Ornament of Great Vehicle Sūtras*, (*mdo sde rgyen, mahāyānasūtralankara*). They are: (1) the great focus on the vast field of the Great Vehicle's collection of teachings; (2) the accomplishment of the benefit of self and others; (3) the primordial awareness realizing the two types of selflessness; (4) the great diligence of performing virtuous deeds for three immeasurable kalpas; (5) the great skill in means that enables one to remain in the cycle of existence, and since one has no mental afflictions, to perform even the seven nonvirtuous deeds of body and speech when necessary; (6) the perfect accomplishment of the powers, fearlessnesses, and unshared qualities; and (7) the spontaneous, uninterrupted activity of the Buddha. *Treasury of Knowledge*, Vol. II, pp.490-1.

vi) The Buddhist philosophical tenet that asserts that: coarse entities and continua of consciousness are the completely false truth; and that the perceived partless particles, and [the perceiving] indivisible moments of consciousness are the actual genuine truth,⁶⁹ is the Particularist school (*bye brag smra ba, vaibhāṣika*).

vii) The Buddhist philosophical tenet that posits: that which can actually and genuinely perform a function is the actual genuine truth, and that which cannot actually and genuinely perform a function is the completely false truth, is the Sūtra school (*mdo sde pa, sautrantika*).

viii) The Buddhist philosophical tenet that posits that: the appearance of [perceiving] subject and [perceived] object as two things [separate from each other] is the completely false truth; and that only consciousness free from this duality of perceiver and perceived is the actual genuine truth, is the Mind-only school (*sems tsam pa, cittamatra*).

ix) The followers of the Mind-only school who maintain that appearances are true as mind are the Mind-only true aspectarians (*sems tsam rnam bden pa*).

x) Those who assert that the two [aspects of the mind], perceiver and perceived, are like an egg that has been cut in half are the Half-eggist Mind-only [true aspectarians] (*sems tsam pa sgo nga phyed tshal ba*).

xi) Those who assert an equal number of perceived and perceivers are the Mind-only [true aspectarians] who assert an equal number of perceived and perceivers (*sems tsam pa gzung 'dzin grang mnyam pa*).

xii) Those who assert that even though a variety of things appear, in actuality there is not a perceiving aspect and a perceived aspect, [that there is just one partless consciousness appearing as different things], are the Mind-only [true aspectarians] who assert that the variety is non-dual (*sems tsam pa sna tshogs gnyis med pa*).

xiii) Those followers of the Mind-only school who assert that appearances are not true as mind, but rather are false appearances, are the Mind-only false aspectarians (*sems tsam rnam rdzun pa*).

xiv) Those who assert that appearances cover the face of consciousness, and that there are dualistic appearances for the Buddha, are the Stained false aspectarians (*rnam rdzun pa dri bcas pa*).

xv) Those who assert that appearances do not cover the face of consciousness, and that there are no dualistic appearances for the Buddha are the Unstained false aspectarians (*rnam rdzun dri med pa*).

xvi) The Buddhist philosophical tenet that posits that the completely false truth is all appearances, however they appear, existing conventionally, like illusory horses and oxen; and that the actual genuine truth is nothing whatsoever, like space, is the [Middle Way] Autonomy school (*dbu ma rang rgyud pa*).

⁶⁹ *Don dam bden pa* is frequently translated as "ultimate truth", but is here translated "actual genuine truth", in an attempt to convey a more literal and precise rendering of the term's meaning—*don* meaning "actual", *dam* meaning "genuine" and *bden pa* meaning "truth". For the definition of the term in this volume, see Section 7.2.1., ix, and for Jamgön Kongtrül's explication of this term's etymology, see the references in note 20, above.

svatantrika madhyamika).

xvii) Those followers of the Middle Way whose explanation of outer objects concords with that of the Sutra school are the Sutra-Autonomy Middle Way school (*mdo sde spyod pa'i dbu ma rang rgyud pa*).

xviii) Those followers of the Middle Way whose explanation of outer objects concords with that of the Mind-only school are the Yogic Conduct-Autonomy Middle Way school (*rnal 'byor spyod pa'i dbu ma rang rgyud pa*).

xix) The Buddhist philosophical tenet that asserts that the completely false truth is whatever is imagined by the mind in speech, thought or expression; and that the true mode of being is the freedom from all elaborations, beyond thought and expression, is the [Middle Way] Consequence school (*dbu ma thal 'gyur pa, prāsaṅgika madhyamika*).

xx) The Buddhist philosophical tenet that asserts that the imaginary nature and the other-dependent nature are the completely false truth, and that the perfectly existent nature, primordial awareness free from elaborations, is the actual genuine truth, is the [Middle Way] Empty-of-other school (*dbu ma gshan stong pa*). [127]

6.3.2. REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS.

i) Someone may say, "The Mind-only school has no [valid] reasonings of its own, apart from those used in the Middle Way school—they have no reasonings that can prove appearances to be mind." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, there are reasonings that prove that appearances are mind, because: by the reason that appearance and mind are of the same essence—mere luminosity—appearances are proven to be mind only, and by the reason that mind and object arise together, appearances are proven to be mind only."

Should the proponent claim, "The first reason is not a quality of the subject," then the answer is, "Yes it is, because the subject is of the essence of mere clarity, and the object is also of the essence of mere clarity."

Should the proponent claim, "The second reason in the answer you just gave is not a quality of the subject," then the answer is, "Yes it is, because any object, whatever it is, appears clearly [and vividly] to the mind. This follows, because if mere clarity did not appear, there would be no mode of appearance. For example, the appearances in a dream."

Should the proponent claim, "The second root reason is not a quality of the subject," then the answer is, "Yes it is, because: first, the object does not exist before the subject [consciousness perceiving it] exists; and second, the subject does not exist before the object exists. For example, the appearances in a dream."

ii) Someone may say, "The Middle Way school has no valid reasons that can prove that all phenomena are emptiness." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, that does in fact follow, because:

"(1) there is the reason that examines the essence of [any given] phenomenon and proves that it does not exist because a phenomenon is neither one nor many;

"(2) there is the reason called the 'vajra thunderbolt' that examines the cause and proves that there is no arising; [128]

"(3) there is the reason that examines the result and proves that there is no arising by refuting the arising of either an existent or a nonexistent [result];

"(4) there is the reason that examines the cause and result together and proves that there is no arising by refuting arising in any one of the four possible ways that it could happen;

"(5) there is the reason of dependent arising, which is the reason that [phenomena are just] dependently arisen mere appearances, and which eliminates both the extreme of nihilism and the extreme of permanence."

Should the proponent claim, "The first reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because there is the reasoning that says: 'Given outer and inner entities, they do not truly exist in essence, because they are beyond being of the nature of one or many.'"

Should the proponent claim, "The second reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because there is the reasoning that says: 'Given outer and inner entities, they do not truly arise, because they do not arise from one of the four possibilities.'"⁷⁰

Should the proponent claim, "The third reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because there is the reasoning that says: 'Given outer and inner entities, they do not arise, because they do not arise from being present at the time of their cause, from not being present at the time of their cause, from both being present and not being present at the time of their cause, or from something other than being present or not being present at the time of their cause.'"

Should the proponent claim, "The fourth reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because there is the reasoning that says: 'Given outer and inner entities, they do not arise, because one truly existent cause does not give rise to one result, [129] one cause does not give rise to many results, many causes do not give rise to one result, and many causes do not give rise to many results.'"

Should the proponent claim, "The fifth reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because there is the reasoning that says: 'Given outer and inner entities, they do not truly exist, because they are mere appearances that are dependently arisen.'"

iii) Someone may say, "The Middle Way Empty-of-other school has reasonings that prove that the completely false truth is empty of itself, but they have no reasonings that can establish that the Buddha Nature is actually and genuinely true." The answer to that is, "given that subject, it does in fact follow,

⁷⁰ The "four possibilities" (*mtha' bzhi*) are: arising from self, from other, from both self and other, or from neither self nor other, i.e. causelessly.

because by the reason that the Dharmakāya pervades all [sentient beings], the reason that the suchness of [the Buddha and sentient beings] is undifferentiable, and the reason that [all beings] have the [Buddha] potential, the Buddha Nature is established as the actual genuine truth.

The above reasonings have been presented in brief; [one should examine] the *Chariot of the Dakpo Lineage's Philosophy*,⁷¹ the *Treasury of Knowledge*, and other texts to see how they are presented in detail.

6.3.3. IN CONCLUSION, A SUMMARIZING VERSE SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE MAY DO SO EASILY.

These various classifications of vehicles
Are all a means to reverse the fabrications of conceptual
mind.
When you realize actual reality, equality, the freedom
from all fabrications,
You have completed your analysis of all the vehicles'
views.

⁷¹ *dwags brgyud grub pa'i zhing rta*, the Eighth Gyalwang Karmapa Mikyö Dorje's commentary on Candrakīrti's *Entrance to the Middle Way*, (*dbu ma la 'jug pa*, *Madhyamakāvatāra*).

**6.4. AS AN ANCILLARY TOPIC,
A BRIEF EXAMINATION OF THE VAJRAYĀNA [130]**

**6.4.1. SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY WISH TO UNDERSTAND
MIGHT GRASP THE DEFINITIONS EASILY,
THEY ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER IN ONE PLACE.**

- i) The extraordinary method, endowed with the profound view and conduct, that must be practiced in a way that is kept very secret from those who are not suitable vessels, is the Secret Mantra.
- ii) The Buddhist tantric [system of] mantra that mainly teaches about outer activity, such as washing, keeping clean, and so forth, is Action Tantra.
- iii) The Buddhist tantric [system of] mantra where the outer action of body and speech, and the inner meditative states of mind are taught to be equally important, is Performance Tantra.
- iv) The Buddhist tantric [system of] mantra where the emphasis becomes meditation on the inner yogas of method and wisdom, and which is very similar to Unsurpassable Tantra is Yoga Tantra.
- v) The Buddhist tantric [system of] mantra that has the power to unite method and wisdom, and is therefore the supreme of all tantras, is the Unsurpassable Tantra.

From the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,⁷²

Action Tantra primarily teaches outer conduct.
Performance Tantra teaches that action and samādhi are
equally important.
Yoga Tantra mainly teaches about the profound and vast
samādhi.
Unsurpassable Tantra is the supreme [tantra], the yoga
that unites method and wisdom. [131]

**6.4.2. SO THAT THOSE MAINLY INTERESTED IN REASONING
MIGHT QUICKLY ENGAGE IN IT,
THE REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER.**

- i) Someone may say, "the Vajrayāna teachings are not assembled into three collections." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, it follows that they are assembled into three collections, because they are placed equally into three collections. This follows, because the All-Powerful Victorious One, the Omniscient Rangjung Dorje, in his text *The Profound Inner Meaning*, teaches in equal measures the inner vinaya, sūtra, and abhidharma [collections]."

⁷² Vol. II, p.580.

ii) Should someone say, "The Buddhist mantra and tantra are the same as the Brahmin mantra and tantra," the answer is, "Given that subject, it follows that they are not the same, because: first, Buddhist mantra and tantra require the practitioner to have renunciation, the awakening mind, and the correct view [before beginning the practice]; and second, whether one meditates on peaceful, 'in-union', or wrathful deities, it is necessary to meditate on them as being in essence inseparable from the Buddha."

Should the proponent claim, "The second reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because the sacred commitment of mantra is that it is necessary to meditate on whichever deity one is practicing, whether peaceful, in-union, or wrathful, as inseparable in essence from the Buddha."

iii) Should someone say, "There is no difference between the view of mantra and the view of the Transcendent Perfection of Wisdom," the answer is, "Given that subject, it follows that there is a difference, because although there is no difference [in the view] that the object is the freedom from conceptual elaborations, there is a difference in that in mantra, the subject is great bliss, and so forth, this point being established in stages. [132]"

iv) Given the Vajrayāna, it has many different names, because:

(1) it is the "awareness" of the primordial wisdoms' great bliss [being aware of] the deities, mantras, and maṇḍalas, and since this is all held by profound method, it is called the collection of teachings of the Holder of Awareness (Vidyādhara), and the Holder of Awareness's Vehicle;

(2) since its practice must be kept very secret from those who are not suitable vessels, it is the Secret Vehicle;

____(3) since it is the vajra path where method and wisdom are not separated, and it involves the practice of the three vajras [of body, speech, and mind], it is the Vajrayāna.

(4) Since it is mainly the practice of the cause of attaining Buddhahood, the Vehicle of Characteristics is called the "Causal Vehicle", and since it makes the aspects of the fruition, such as the deities, maṇḍalas and so forth, into the path, the Vajrayāna is called the Fruition Vehicle. Furthermore, the "emptiness endowed with all supreme aspects"⁷³ is the cause, and since the Vehicle of Characteristics primarily focuses on this, it is called the Causal Vehicle; and unchanging great bliss is the abiding in the way of the fruition, and since the Vajrayāna mainly focuses on this, it is called the Fruition Vehicle.

(5) Since it has more and faster methods than the Vehicle of Characteristics, it is called the Method Vehicle.

And so forth.

v) In the Vajrayāna tradition, all possible appearances are the infinite expanse of purity, because the

⁷³According to Lord Jonang, "emptiness endowed with all supreme aspects" is not just a mere non-affirming negation, not just the mere freedom from elaborations, but clarity and awareness undifferentiable, awareness and emptiness undifferentiable.

outer physical environment has always been the pure maṇḍala, the beings within it are the innately pure deities, and [beings' mental] continua, the eight collections of consciousness, are pure primordial awareness. [133]

vi) In the Vajrayāna tradition, existence and peace (saṁsāra and nirvāṇa) are the same, because in the expanse of the true nature, free from all elaborations, they are of one taste. And as for reasonings that refute elaborations, no others besides the five great Middle Way reasonings are necessary.

vii) In the Vajrayāna tradition, there is a presentation of the three tantras, because the undifferentiability of body and mind is the causal tantra; the undifferentiability of method and wisdom is the method tantra; and the undifferentiability of the two kāyas is the fruition tantra.

viii) Should someone say, "Since development stage [practices] are just imagined by thoughts, all one needs to meditate upon is the completion stage," the answer to that is, "Given the completely imagined development stage, it is necessary to meditate upon it, because from [traversing the] contrived path, one is able to enter into the uncontrived path, and [development stage meditation] is a method [by which one can do that].

Should the proponent claim, "The reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because in dependence upon the path of the contrived development stage, one is able to enter the uncontrived completion stage," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

6.4.3. IN CONCLUSION, A SUMMARIZING VERSE SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE MAY DO SO EASILY.

What is the Great Secret Vehicle?

Know it to be the purity of environment, beings, and
mindstream.

When you realize that in reality, existence and peace are
the same,

All appearances of saṁsāra and nirvāṇa are the pure realm
of the Victorious Ones' three kāyas.

It is also said like that. [134]

7. AN ANALYSIS OF HOW TO GAIN CERTAINTY THROUGH REFLECTION

- 7.1. An analysis of gaining certainty about the keys to understanding.
- 7.2. An analysis of gaining certainty about that which is to be understood: the provisional and definitive meanings in the three turnings of the wheel of Dharma, the two truths, and dependent arising.
- 7.3. An analysis of gaining certainty about the main thing, the view.
- 7.4. An analysis of gaining certainty about a brief teaching on the four turnings of the mind from the tradition of pith instructions.

7.1. AN ANALYSIS OF GAINING CERTAINTY ABOUT THE KEYS TO UNDERSTANDING.

7.1.1. DEFINITIONS.

Given individuals who strongly desire to attain liberation and omniscience, they must gain certainty by reflecting on the meaning of [the teachings] they have heard, because by just listening one will not be able to realize actual reality just as it is, and if one properly analyzes the meaning of what one has studied, one will definitely realize actual reality just as it is.

- i) The expression of the mind that feels [objects] is examination.
- ii) The expression of the mind that examines individually is analysis.
- iii) That which is associated with mental activity or mere thinking is worldly examination and analysis.
- iv) Intelligence that engages in the meaning of the true nature is examination and analysis associated with prajñā.
- v) The method of engaging in the fundamental nature that is understood in stages by means of speech, thought, and expression, and that is taught using superimposition, is the provisional meaning.
- vi) Whatever suitably teaches that the true mode of being (*dharmatā*) of all phenomena is emptiness, the profound actual reality that is free from all elaborations like "arising", "cessation", and so forth; or that the true nature of the fundamental mode of being is of the nature of clear light, inexpressible, inconceivable, and indescribable, is the definitive meaning. [135]
- vii) When there is a hidden meaning to that which was actually taught; these two (the literal expression and the hidden meaning) can be [connected] in one sentence that shows them not to be contradictory;

and there is a *basic intention*,⁷⁴ a *necessity*,⁷⁵ and a *refuter*,⁷⁶ this is a **teaching with an intention**.

Of these there are four types:

(1) the intention of equality. For example, [when contemplating the equality of the Dharmakāya, the Buddha said,] "At that time, I was the Thus Gone One named The One who has Insight"⁷⁷

(2) the intention of a different meaning. For example, when contemplating the three modes of absence of essence, [the Buddha said], "All phenomena have no essence."

(3) The intention of a different time. For example, [the Buddha said], "Just by taking the name of the Thus Gone One 'Stainless Moonlight' (*dri med zla 'od*), you will attain enlightenment."

(4) the intention in accordance with the attitude of the individual. For example, to those who clung to the view that right conduct is supreme, [the Buddha] de-emphasized right conduct and praised generosity.

viii) The means of guiding those to be tamed where the Buddha taught only some words and part of [His intention] is called **coded intention**. Of these there are four types:

(1) the coded intention of entering. Some [disciples] with the Hearers' potential were afraid of emptiness, and had not yet entered the Great Vehicle. In order to cause them to enter, the Buddha said, "Form exists." Given such a statement, it is the coded intention of entering, because the listeners, having understood this statement to be true, enter [the Great Vehicle], while the teacher's intention is that [form exists] in the way of being mere appearance, like in a dream.

(2) the coded intention of characteristics. Given [the Buddha's] statement, "All phenomena are without essence," [136] it is the coded intention of characteristics, because to those who posited nonexistence, contemplating the imaginary nature, [the Buddha] said, "It does not exist," and to those who posited existence, contemplating the perfectly existent nature, [He] taught, "It exists."

(3) the coded intention of remedies. Given a statement of the Buddha's such as, "At that time, I was the Tathāgata Vairocana," it is the coded intention of remedies, because it is the remedy for the fault of thinking that because the Buddha Śākyamuni was of a small physical stature and a short lifespan, He was inferior to other Teachers.

⁷⁴ Defined by Jamgön Kongtrül as "another meaning", Vol. III, p.6.

⁷⁵ The necessity being, "to tame the beings who are to be tamed in this way." Ibid.

⁷⁶ "Scriptures and logic that show that the [literal meaning] of the actual teaching in question is not how things actually are." Ibid.

⁷⁷ {de bzhin gshegs pa rnam gzhigs} Tathāgata Vīpaśhyī, the first Buddha of this kalpa.

(4) the coded intention of transformation. Given the teachings that are incredibly difficult to understand, they are the coded intention of transformation, because they were spoken in order to pacify the fault of thinking, "This [Buddhist] dharma is so easy to understand! It must be inferior to other teachings."

ix) **[The four reliances.]** That object in which you trust and on which you depend is a reliance.

Given individuals who strongly wish to attain liberation and omniscience, they should:

(1) rely on the meaning and not on the words, because if they do not understand the meaning, just the words alone will not be able to either liberate them or to achieve omniscience for them.

(2) rely on the dharma and not on the individual. This means that they should] rely on [a teacher] whose Dharmic view and conduct are unmistakable, not on an individual [just because he is] from a high caste, a noble family, is famous, or is wealthy, because if [those individuals] do not have [a teacher with] the unmistakable view and conduct, just their reliance on an individual will neither liberate them nor place them in the state of omniscience.

(3) rely on primordial awareness, not on discursive consciousness, [137] because without the primordial awareness that realizes the true nature of all phenomena, merely thinking about the objects that discursive consciousness experiences will neither liberate [those individuals] nor place them in the state of omniscience.

(4) rely on the definitive meaning, not on the provisional meaning, because making the provisional meaning their main focus will neither liberate them nor attain omniscience for them, while making the definitive meaning their main focus *will* do so.

x) **[The four things that are logical].** That which is renowned in the world, which merely on the level of what is completely false is established through valid cognition, and which if analyzed is found to be justifiable and appropriate, is called logical.

(1) the logic of dependence is [for example] that it is logical for a sprout to arise in dependence upon a seed.

(2) the logic of specific action is [for example] that the sense faculties and consciousnesses each perform the activity of perceiving their own specific objects, but they do not perform some other function.

(3) the logic that proves something is justified is direct, inferential, and scriptural valid cognition.

(4) the logic of the natural way of being is emptiness, selflessness [and so forth], all general and specific characteristics of [phenomena] that have been known to be as they are from the very outset.

Vajrayāna

Given the Vajrayāna tradition, initially it is extremely important to understand the difference between the provisional and the definitive meanings, because knowing that there were some unfortunate ones who would not realize the actuality of perfect suchness [in this life] and that there were some fortunate ones who would, with one [stream of] vajra words [the Buddha] taught different meanings. [138]

xi) The six alternatives:

(1) Given the Vajrayāna tradition, it has a way of presenting the provisional meaning, because colored sand maṇḍalas and so forth are the method, together with its branches, for entering the inner way of being.⁷⁸

(2) Given the Vajrayāna tradition, it has a way of presenting the definitive meaning, because the teachings on the true nature of the causal tantra and on the completion stage are the definitive meaning.

(3) When in one vajra word there lies the intention to convey different meanings, that is a statement with a hidden intention. If this is divided, there are three:

(a) the intention of a different time. When contemplating that at the end of the continuum of the tenth ground, a bodhisattva becomes enlightened in one instant, the Buddha said in the *Net of Magical Illusion Tantra*,⁷⁹ "you will become perfectly enlightened in one instant."

(b) the intention of a different meaning. When contemplating that the Transcendent Perfection of Wisdom, the consort of all the Buddhas, should be continuously enjoyed [like the reflections in a magic mirror], the Buddha said in the *Mahāmāyā Tantra*,

Wrest her away from all the Buddhas
And enjoy this daughter of the supreme of gods.

(c) the intention in accordance with [a certain individual's way of] thinking. When contemplating the necessity of killing clinging to self, which [the Buddha] called the "great life-force wind", He said in the Hevajra, "You should kill that which has life-force."

(4) When the meaning expressed does not depend on a basic intention, but rather, can be clearly understood through the direct teaching that expresses it, this is a Tantric statement without a hidden intention. For example, [139]

You should not take life,

⁷⁸ According to Khenpo Rinpoche, this phrase of Jamgön Kongtrül's, "inner way of being" (*nang gi tshul*), means the "true nature of mind".

⁷⁹ {rgyud sgyu 'phrul drwa ba}

Neither should you speak falsehood.

(5) When [the Buddha], using very well-known words found in worldly commentaries and so forth, taught about the names and meanings of tantric [rituals], these are statements to be taken literally, for example, [the teachings about] maṇḍalas, fire pujas, and tormas.

(6) That which is not well-known in worldly commentaries, the Tantras which are the Thus Gone One's secret language wrapped up in symbols, are statements not to be taken literally, for example, when [the Buddha gave] the name "koṭākyāḥ" to the ten winds, and so forth.

xii) The four modes:

(1) the explanation that covers just the etymology of words, given according to texts on valid cognition and etymology is the word's meaning.

(2) the general meaning [is comprised of] first, that which reverses the regret at [having engaged in] the Sūtra [Vehicle] and other [practices], and second, the development stage. If this is divided, there are: that which reverses the regret at having engaged in the Sūtra Vehicle and other practices, that which reverses the regret one feels from engaging in inner mantra, and the general meaning of the development stage. These should be explained orally.

(3) the hidden meaning.

The hidden Dharma of desire, the hidden relative truth,
[and]
Superior, middling, and lowest heart-essence—these are
the hidden meaning.⁸⁰

(4) the ultimate meaning.

Clear light is the [ultimate] path and union is the
[ultimate] fruition.
This is the meaning of ultimate. In one very vajra word,
The four modes are differentiated in accordance with
beings' faculties.⁸¹ [140]

The meaning of these verses should be explained on the path of oral instructions.

⁸⁰ Vol. III, p.16.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*

7.1.2. REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS.

i) Someone may say, "If it is that which distinguishes what in the teachings of the Buddha is the provisional and what is the definitive meaning, then it is definitely either: the provisional and definitive meanings; the four intentions; the four coded intentions; the four reliances; or the four things that are logical, whichever of these is appropriate." The answer to that is, "Given the six alternatives and the four modes of the Vajrayāna, it would then follow that they do not distinguish the provisional and definitive meanings, because they are not included in the above topics. [And it] follows [that they are not included in the above topics], because they distinguish the extraordinary definitive and provisional meanings of the Vajrayāna."

Should the proponent accept the answering proposition, then the answer is, "Given the six alternatives and the four modes, they distinguish the provisional from the definitive meanings [in the Buddha's teachings], because they distinguish the definitive and provisional meanings of the unsurpassable mantra.

ii) Someone may say, "Given creation stage meditation, you do not need to practice it, because it is imagined by thoughts." The answer to that is, "Given creation stage meditation that is imagined by thoughts, you do need to practice it, because it is a method of going from the fabricated path to the unfabricated path. For example, in the Common Vehicle, first one meditates on the body as being impure, and then progresses to meditating on the body as being selfless. Also, in the Great Vehicle, in dependence upon first giving rise to fabricated, completely false awakening mind, one can then engage in giving rise to the actual, genuine awakening mind."

iii) Someone may say, "If it is the definitive meaning, it is definitely either emptiness alone, or the mere freedom from elaborations." The answer to that is, "Given this subject, that does not follow, because: the Buddha Nature, primordial awareness free from conceptual elaborations, is the ultimate definitive meaning, and, this [Buddha Nature] is not [either emptiness alone or the mere freedom from elaborations]." [141]

iv) Someone may say, "[When the Buddha said], 'In one instant you will become the perfect Buddha,' that scripture is the definitive meaning." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, it follows that it is not the definitive meaning, because it is the provisional meaning. That follows, because it is the provisional meaning with an intention. That follows, because it is a [statement] with the intention of a different time. That follows, because [when the Buddha said that, He was] contemplating that at the end of the continuum of the tenth ground, the antidote for the subtle cognitive obscurations, the vajra-like samādhi, defeats [these obscurations] and in one instant [the bodhisattva] becomes Buddha.

v) Someone may say, "The Secret Mantra's creation stage is the definitive meaning." The answer to that is, "Given the creation stage, it is not the definitive meaning, because it is a method for entering the definitive meaning. That follows, because the ultimate definitive meaning is the completion stage," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

To say again,

The provisional, definitive, the four intentions, the four coded intentions,
The four reliances, the four things that are logical—these distinguish the provisional from the definitive in the sūtras.
The six alternatives and the four modes are the way of the provisional and definitive in mantra.
Those intelligent ones who are skilled in distinguishing these will be swiftly liberated.

It is also said like that.

**7.2. AN ANALYSIS OF GAINING CERTAINTY
ABOUT THAT WHICH IS TO BE UNDERSTOOD:
THE PROVISIONAL AND DEFINITIVE MEANINGS
IN THE THREE TURNINGS OF THE WHEEL OF DHARMA,
THE TWO TRUTHS, AND DEPENDENT ARISING. [142]**

7.2.1. DEFINITIONS.

- i) That which is included in the scriptures and reasonings that eliminate whatever is not in accord with the [attainment of] liberation is a Wheel of Dharma.
- ii) The [Buddha's] speech that mainly teaches the subject of the four noble truths is the First Turning of the Wheel of Dharma.
- iii) The [Buddha's] speech that mainly teaches the subject of the profound emptiness is the Second Turning of the Wheel.
- iv) The [Buddha's] speech that mainly teaches the subject of primordial awareness free of conceptual activity is the Third Turning of the Wheel.
- v) [A sūtra] that mainly teaches the completely false truth as a suitable method for causing the spiritual potential in the disciples of the three vehicles⁸² to awaken, and that causes [these disciples] to enter the path leading to the most excellent result is a sūtra of the provisional meaning.
- vi) A sūtra that mainly teaches the actual genuine truth, thereby facilitating achievement of the state that arises from meditating on the path that leads to the most excellent result, the non-abiding transcendence of suffering (nirvāṇa); and that is for those few disciples who can bear the profound truth, is a sūtra of the definitive meaning.

In short, a sūtra that mainly teaches the completely false truth is a sūtra of the provisional meaning, and

⁸² The vehicles of the Hearers, Solitary Realizers, and Bodhisattvas.

a sūtra that mainly teaches the actual genuine truth is a sūtra of the definitive meaning.

vii) That which is undeceiving as either the completely false or the actual and genuine is mere truth.

viii) That which is undeceiving only as the completely false is the completely false truth.

ix) That which is undeceiving as being actual and genuine is the actual genuine truth.

Alternatively, that which is fabricated and superimposed is the completely false truth, and that which is not fabricated and not superimposed is the actual genuine truth.

Alternatively, the object found by the non-analytical minds [of the immature] and that is seen falsely is the completely false truth, [143] and the actuality found by the awareness of the Noble ones that is seen correctly is the actual genuine truth.

x) The two truths according to the Particularist school are:

Something that [can be] destroyed by a hammer or some other instrument; or upon its being mentally dissected the mind that perceives it is suitable to be discarded, is the completely false truth. Something of which cognition is not discarded by physical destruction or mental analysis is the actual genuine truth.

xi) The two truths according to the Sūtra school are:

That which can actually and genuinely perform a function is the actual genuine truth. A phenomenon that cannot actually and genuinely perform a function is the completely false truth.

xii) The two truths according to the Mind-only school are:

The dualistic appearance of perceiver and perceived, of subject and object, is the completely false truth. Mere consciousness free of the duality of perceiver and perceived is the actual genuine truth.

xiii) The two truths according to the Middle Way Autonomy School are:

All appearances, whatever they are, completely falsely exist. This is the completely false truth. Actually and genuinely, nothing exists, like space. This is the actual genuine truth.

xiv) The two truths according to the Middle Way Consequence School are:

Phenomena that the mind imagines [through] speech, thought, and expression are the completely false truth. The fundamental state that is free from conceptual elaborations, transcending all thought and expression, is the actual genuine truth.

xv) The two truths according to the Great Middle Way Yogic Conduct⁸³ school or the Great Middle Way Empty-of-other school are: [144]

All phenomena included in the imaginary nature and the other-dependent nature are the completely false truth. The primordial awareness that is free from all conceptually elaborated extremes is the actual genuine truth. Alternatively, the expanse and primordial awareness undifferentiable is the actual genuine truth.

xvi) The two truths according to Mantra are:

In addition to the [characteristics] given to the completely false truth by the various Middle Way schools, it is adorned [with the superior feature] of objects being the wheel of the maṇḍala—this is the completely false truth. In addition to the characteristics given to it by the various Middle Way schools, the actual genuine truth is adorned with the superior feature of the subject being great bliss. This is the actual genuine truth.

xvii) Especially, the explanation of the Victorious and Omniscient Rangjung Dorje,

The completely false is the appearance of perceiver and perceived.

Its truth is that it is like a moon in the water.

The actual and genuine is the eighteen emptinesses.

Its truth is nondual primordial awareness.

xviii) All phenomena of saṃsāra and nirvāṇa by their very nature are pure—this is the dependent arising of the fundamental state of being.

xix) The forward progression [of results arising from causes; the occurrence of things] in an interrelated fashion in dependence upon outer and inner [causes] and conditions is the dependent arising of cyclic existence.

xx) The ceasing of ignorance, the cause of cyclic existence, resulting in the successive cessations of the remaining eleven links, is the reverse progression that crosses over from cyclic existence. [145]

As is stated in the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,⁸⁴

Those who see [dependent arising in its] reverse
progression, the dependent arising of nirvāṇa,
Touch the heart of the Buddha's teachings.
Therefore, put great effort into thinking about and then
realizing the meaning [of these topics].

⁸³{rnal 'byor spyod pa} *Yogācāra*. This was the name used in India for what in Tibet came to be known as the Empty-of-other school.

⁸⁴ Vol. III, p.47.

**7.2.2. SO THAT THOSE MAINLY INTERESTED IN REASONING
MIGHT QUICKLY ENGAGE IN IT,
THE REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER.**

i) Should someone say, "If it is the Buddha's teaching, it must be the definitive meaning," the answer is, "Given that subject, your conclusion does not follow, because the first turning of the wheel is the Buddha's speech, and it is not the definitive meaning. This follows, because it is not [comprised of] sūtras that mainly teach about the actual genuine truth as their subject," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

ii) Someone may say, "The first turning is the provisional meaning, the second is the definitive meaning, and the third has both the provisional meaning and the definitive meaning in it." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, your conclusion is not proven, because you can prove it only with reasoning; you cannot prove it with any reference to scripture. The latter reason follows, because from amongst the scriptures that explain what is the provisional meaning and what is the definitive meaning, you will not find a single one that explicitly distinguishes the provisional from the definitive meaning in the way you claim them to be distinguished."

iii) Someone may say, "It follows that the third turning is not the ultimate definitive meaning, because there are no valid means of proving that it is." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, there are valid means of proof, because: the scriptures prove it; [146] [Asaṅga], the bodhisattva on the third ground whom the Teacher himself prophesied would be the one to distinguish the definitive from the provisional, asserts that the third turning is the ultimate definitive meaning; and it can be proven to be so with reasoning."

Should the proponent claim, "The first reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because as the Buddha said in the *Noble Sūtra Unravelling the Intention*,⁸⁵

Initially, in Varanasi, the Transcendent Conqueror.... turned the Wheel of Dharma. [This turning] is surpassable, refutable, is the provisional meaning, and is the basis for debate. Then the Transcendent Conqueror turned the Wheel of Dharma for a second time, beginning with the teaching that all phenomena have no essence.... This turning is also surpassable, refutable, is the provisional meaning, and is the basis for debate. Then, however, the Transcendent Conqueror, beginning with the teaching that all phenomena have no essence... turned the miraculous third turning of the Wheel of Dharma. This turning is unsurpassable, irrefutable, the definitive meaning, and is not the basis for debate."

Furthermore, in the *Sūtra of the Great Drum*,⁸⁶ He says,

Be aware that any and all of My [presentations] of emptiness I made with a [hidden] intention, but

⁸⁵ {mdo sde dgongs pa nges par 'grel pa'i mdo}, *Saṁdhinirmocanasūtra*.

⁸⁶ {rnga bo che chen po'i le'u yi mdo} *Mahābherihāraṅgarakapariṣvartasūtra*.

in the unsurpassable sūtras,⁸⁷ I have no [hidden] intention.

Statements of the Buddha like this demonstrate that in the sūtras on Buddha Nature, the Buddha very clearly distinguishes between what is the provisional meaning and what is the definitive meaning again and again. [147]

Should the proponent claim, "The second reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because the Buddha clearly prophesied that the noble Asaṅga would be the one to distinguish the provisional meaning from the definitive meaning. This follows, because the Buddha said,

The monk named Asaṅga
Will be perfectly learned in the commentaries.
The provisional and definitive of the sūtra collection
He will distinguish perfectly into many aspects.

There is pervasion, because [Asaṅga] himself stated that the final turning is the ultimate definitive meaning.

Should the proponent claim, "The third reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because in the *Sūtra of the Questions of King Dhārāṇīśvara*,⁸⁸ the Buddha spoke the parable of the 'three cleansings of the gem,' and connected these with the three turnings of the Wheel of Dharma, and so [this point] is also proven with reasoning. This follows, because with a coarse method, the gem's coarser stains are removed; with a fine method, the gem's subtle stains are removed; and with an extremely fine method, the gem's extremely fine stains are removed.

"Similarly, the coarse method of the first turning removes gross conceptions, the second [turning's] subtle method removes subtle conceptions, and the third [turning's] extremely subtle method removes extremely subtle conceptions. Therefore, if one examines with reasoning, one finds that [the conclusion that the third turning is the ultimate definitive meaning] is appropriate."

iv) Someone may say, "The second turning is the ultimate definitive meaning, because the glorious Candrakīrti explained it to be so." The answer is, "Given that subject, it follows that your conclusion is inappropriate, because the glorious Candrakīrti does not make a presentation [of what in the] first, second, and third turnings [is the provisional and what is the definitive]; he merely distinguishes the provisional from the definitive [according to] the *Sūtra Spoken at the Request of the Bodhisattva 'Inexhaustible Intelligence'*."⁸⁹

"There is pervasion, because: as the Buddha taught in that sūtra, [148] 'Know the sūtras whose meaning is emptiness to be the definitive meaning'; and, the first and the third turnings also taught emptiness.

⁸⁷The final turning's sūtras on Buddha Nature.

⁸⁸{gzugs kyi dbang phyug rgyal pos zhugs pa'i mdo}, *Dhārāṇīśvarāja-paripṛicchasūtra*.

⁸⁹{blo gros mi zad pas bstan pa'i mdo} *Akṣayamatiniṛdeśasūtra*.

That follows, because there is speech [of the Buddha] in the first turning that refutes arising from any of the four possibilities. [As the Protector Nāgārjuna wrote in the] *Fundamental Wisdom of the Middle Way*,⁹⁰

The Transcendent Conqueror, who fathoms both entities
and nonentities,
In his Oral Instructions to Katyāyana,
Spoke of existence and nonexistence,
And refuted both of them.

v) Someone may say, "The way of distinguishing the provisional from the definitive meanings in the *Sūtra Unravelling the Intention* and so forth is the Mind-only school's way of doing so." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, it follows that your conclusion is inappropriate, because if the way of distinguishing the provisional from the definitive in the *Sūtra Unravelling the Intention* and so forth were the way of the Mind-only school, there would have to be some other sūtras that distinguish the provisional from the definitive in connection with the three turnings from the perspective of the Middle Way school, and there are no such sūtras."

vi) Someone may say, "The provisional meaning is false and not suitable to be relied upon." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, it follows that it is not like that, because [the provisional] is a method for entering the definitive, and a method for realizing the definitive. That follows, because the completely false truth is the method, and the actual genuine truth is [the result that] arises from the method," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

7.2.3. IN CONCLUSION, A SUMMARIZING VERSE SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE MAY DO SO EASILY.

What is provisional and definitive in the sūtra collection,
The Teacher Himself clearly distinguished,
As did the prophesied demarcator, the Noble one on the
third ground.
How could the provisional and definitive possibly be
proven to be otherwise? [149]

7.3. AN EXAMINATION OF GAINING CERTAINTY ABOUT THE MAIN THING, THE VIEW.

There are seven parts.

7.3.1. THE REASON WHY IT IS NECESSARY TO HAVE THE ACCURATE VIEW.

⁹⁰{dbu ma rtsa ba shes rab} *Mūlamadhyamakaśāstra*.

Given the individuals who seek liberation and omniscience, they need the accurate view, because: they need to abandon ignorance, the root of obscuration; the remedy for that is the prajñā that realizes selflessness, and without that prajñā the root of obscuration can never be abandoned, and so forth, this point being established in stages.

Given the same subject, there is a reason why they must initially ascertain the view, [and that reason] is that all the Dharma that the Victorious One, the perfect Buddha, taught, flows towards and enters into the dharmadhātu alone. There is pervasion, because in order to realize the dharmadhātu, one needs the accurate view. This follows, because one must recognize and abandon the faults of wrong views, and one must recognize and perfectly adopt the accurate view.

7.3.2. AN EXPLANATION OF HOW TO GIVE RISE TO THE VIEW THAT REALIZES SELFLESSNESS.

Given the same subject, there is a way to give up clinging to a self, [which is comprised of] the views of the transitory collection, is caused by ignorance, and is the root of the four mistaken views,⁹¹ because if one gives rise to its antidote, the prajñā that realizes selflessness, one will give it up. [150] This follows, because [prajñā] is the remedy that pulls up clinging to self from the root.

Given ignorance, it is both the cause and the result of the views of the transitory collection, because in dependence upon ignorance the views of the transitory collection arise, and in dependence upon developing the habitual tendencies of the views of the transitory collection, ignorance arises, and so forth, this point being established in stages.

7.3.3. THE PRELIMINARIES: AN EXPLANATION OF THE FOUR SEALS THAT EPITOMIZE THE SŪTRAS.

Given all composite phenomena, they are impermanent, because at no time do they ever have the opportunity to be permanent.

Given all defiled phenomena, they are suffering, because they are of the nature of the three types of suffering.

Given all phenomena, they are empty and selfless, because they are empty of having a creator, and they are absent a "self" that is either permanent, single, or independent.

Given nirvāṇa, it is liberation and peace, because it is the thoroughly blissful liberation and because it is the peace that is undisturbed by the waves of the mental afflictions.

Given the four seals that are the general marks of the Buddha's teachings, they are important at the outset

⁹¹ The four mistaken views are: taking that which is unclean to be clean; taking that which is suffering to be happiness; taking that which is impermanent to be permanent; and taking that which is selfless to have or to be a self.

of ascertaining the view, because if one does not give rise to certainty about them, one will have difficulty giving rise to certainty that really cuts through extremes concerning the meaning of "selflessness".

7.3.4. ENTERING THE PATH OF GIVING UP THE TWO EXTREMES.

7.3.4.1. THE WAY TO GIVE UP THE TWO EXTREMES IN GENERAL. [151]

Given individuals who seek liberation and omniscience, it is necessary that they enter the path of giving up the two extremes, because the general tradition of our own [Buddhist path] is for the subject, *prajñā* that knows actual genuine reality, to cut through elaborations concerning the object of its knowledge. This follows, because all of our philosophical schools of tenets must, each according to their own tradition, cut through the elaborations of permanence and nihilism.

Given, from amongst all of our philosophical schools, the Middle Way tradition, it is supreme, because it realizes that the true nature is free from all conceptual elaborations, and that the way of appearance is merely dependently arisen.

7.3.4.2. SPECIFICALLY, AN EXPLANATION OF THE MIDDLE WAY TRADITION.

7.3.4.2.1. AN EXPLANATION OF HOW EMPTINESS IS RECOGNIZED IN GENERAL.

Given the subject of the term *emptiness*, there are ways of engaging in it in general, because: according to the view of the Middle Way Yogic Conduct school, the Great Middle Way Empty-of-other tradition, [actual genuine reality is] primordial awareness that is empty of the duality of perceiver and perceived and that negates the objects of negation, the two types of self; and according to those who propound the view of the Empty-of-self (*rang stong*) school, [emptiness] is just the nonaffirming negation that refutes the two types of self.

7.3.4.2.2. THE EXPLANATION OF THE EMPTY-OF-SELF SCHOOL'S TRADITION.

Given the Empty-of-self school, it has a way of explaining emptiness just how it is, because: [152] the basis of emptiness, the subject, is all phenomena to be known, and the object of negation of which [this basis] is empty is also the basis of negation itself.⁹²

Should someone say, "The reason is not a quality of the subject," then the answer is, "Yes it is, because from the perspective of analysis, one negates the phenomenon itself, and apart from that, one does not need to look for any 'horns' to negate, such as 'true existence' or anything else. That follows, because by

⁹² The basis of negation, the basis of emptiness, and the object of negation are all the same thing. So for example, in the reasoning "Given a table as the subject, it is empty of being a table," the subject or basis is "table", and what is negated, what this subject is empty of, is also "table".

refuting the 'horns', one cannot negate the idea that the subject is real, and one will not realize the true being (*dharmatā*) of that phenomena.⁹³

7.3.4.2.3. AN EXPLANATION OF THE EMPTY-OF-OTHER TRADITION.

Given the Empty-of-other tradition, the perfectly existent nature is empty of other, because it is empty of the objects of negation, the imaginary nature and the other-dependent nature.

Should someone claim, "That does not follow," then the answer is, "Yes it does, because the perfectly existent primordial awareness free from elaborations is not polluted by the imaginary or the other-dependent."

Should someone claim, "that does not follow," the answer is, "Yes it does, because the basic state of primordial awareness free from elaborations is that it is free from stains."

Should someone claim, "that does not follow," the answer is, "Yes it does, for as it says in *The Final and Highest in the Line of the Great Vehicle's Teachings*,⁹⁴

Pure, and endowed with mental afflictions.

"Pure refers to the fact that in the true nature, there are no stains. For example, even though the sky is obscured by clouds, the basic nature of the sky is not polluted by clouds," and so forth, this point being established with a great number of reasons.

7.3.5. THE MAIN TOPIC, AN ANALYSIS OF THE TWO TYPES OF SELFLESSNESS.

Someone may say, "All phenomena are not empty of self, because there is no valid reasoning that can prove that they are." [153] The answer is, "Given that subject, it does follow [that they are empty], because there are valid reasons establishing the selflessness of phenomena, and there are valid reasons establishing the selflessness of the individual."

Should the proponent claim, "The first reason is not a quality of the subject," then the answer is, "Yes it is, because from analyzing the entity, there is the reason of being neither one nor many; from analyzing the cause, there is the vajra thunderbolt reason; from analyzing the result, there is the reason that refutes the arising of an existent or a nonexistent [result]; from analyzing the cause and result, there is the reason that refutes the occurrence of arising from any one of the four possible [combinations of cause and result];

⁹³ The analogy being drawn here is that if someone says, "that table is not empty of itself, it is empty of true existence," that is akin to saying, "that man over there has no horns." One is saying that the phenomenon is empty of a quality that no one can perceive, that no one ever attributed to the phenomenon in the first place. This type of emptiness has no power to reverse our clinging to phenomena as being real.

⁹⁴ {theg pa chen po'i rgyud bla ma} *Mahāyānottaratantraśāstra*.

and from analyzing mere appearance there is the reason of dependent arising.

Should the proponent claim, "The first of these reasons is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because 'Given all phenomena of saṃsāra and nirvāṇa, they do not exist in essence, because they do not have the nature of being either one or many.' This reason is a valid reason, and this follows, because it is a reason of negation in which the three modes are complete."

Should the proponent claim, "The second of these reasons is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because the reason that arising does not happen from any of the four possible sources proves that inner and outer entities do not arise."

Should the proponent claim, "The third of these reasons is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because from examining whether or not at the time of its cause a result exists, does not exist, both, or neither, one [reaches] the reason of 'no arising' that proves that inner and outer phenomena do not arise."

Should the proponent claim, "The fourth of these reasons is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because from examining the four possible [combinations] of cause and result, such as a single cause not being able to produce a single result, and so forth, one reaches the reason of 'no arising' that proves that inner and outer entities never arise." [154]

Should the proponent claim, "The fifth of these reasons is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because the reason that everything is just dependently arisen appearance is the reason that proves that all phenomena of saṃsāra and nirvāṇa have never truly existed," and so forth, and from the reasonings [like these] that are presented in the great texts of the Middle Way's tradition, one should give rise to certainty [about emptiness].

Should the proponent claim, "The second root reason is not a quality of the subject," then the answer is, "Yes it is, because if one analyzes using the seven-fold reasoning of the chariot, [one finds] that the self of the individual does not exist.

Should the proponent claim, "That reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because:

"(1) just as the chariot does not exist apart from the parts of the chariot, so the self does not exist apart from the aggregates;

"(2) just as the chariot is not the parts of the chariot, so the self is not the five aggregates;

"(3) just as there is no chariot that possesses the chariot parts, so there is no self that possesses the five aggregates;

"(4) just as the chariot does not depend on or abide in the parts of the chariot, so the self does not depend on or abide in the five aggregates;

"(5) just as the chariot's parts do not depend on or abide in the chariot, so the five aggregates do not

depend on or abide in the self;

"(6) just as the mere collection of chariot parts is not the chariot, so the mere collection of the aggregates is not the self; and

"(7) just as the mere shape of the collection of chariot parts is not the chariot, so the mere shape of the collection of the aggregates is not the self."

And so forth, this point being established with an infinitude of reasons. [155]

7.3.6. AN EXAMINATION OF THE PARTICULAR VIEWS OF MANTRA.

Someone may say, "There is no difference between the views of mantra held by the Empty-of-self and the Empty-of-other schools." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, there is a difference. The reason for that difference is that the Empty-of-self school holds that from the perspective of the subject being great bliss, mantra is different from [the views expressed in the sūtras on the Transcendent Perfection of Wisdom (*prajñāpāramitā*)], but in the sense that the object is the freedom from elaborations, mantra is not different from *prajñāpāramitā*. The Empty-of-other school concurs [with the Empty-of-self school] about the subject, but maintains that the object is not merely true being, the freedom from elaborations—rather, it is emptiness endowed with all supreme aspects, beyond even the smallest and subtlest of particles, in its nature like reflections in a magic mirror." And so forth, this point being established with many reasons.

7.3.7. IN BRIEF, THE VIEW OF THE UNBORN UNION.

Given the realization of the union of the unborn basis and its unimpeded radiance, this is the ultimate realization in all of sūtra and tantra, because apart from this, there is no "Transcendent Perfection of Wisdom," "Mahāmudrā", and so forth, this point being established with reasons.

Again it is said,

Like that there are different stages in the view, but
In the true nature, the fundamental mode, no
distinctions exist.
Therefore, clinging to differences is conceptuality's stain—
Flow into mahāmudrā's basis, free of conceptual mind.

It is also said like that. [156]

7.4. AN ANALYSIS OF THE FOUR TURNINGS OF THE MIND, FROM THE TRADITION OF PITH INSTRUCTIONS.

i) Someone may say, "Those who have studied and reflected on the great texts do not need to meditate

on the four turnings of the mind from the tradition of pith instructions." The answer to this is, "Individuals who have [truly taken the great texts to heart] as essential advice for them to follow need not focus at all on the four turnings of the mind. However, given those individuals who are unable to study and reflect on the great texts appropriately, or who are so able but are ordinary individuals who have not yet taken the great texts completely to heart, they should meditate on the four turnings of the mind from the tradition of pith instructions because:

"(1) as a means of turning the mind away from attachment to this life, one must meditate on the support for turning the mind, the difficulty of obtaining the freedoms and resources [of the human life], and on [what actually turns the mind, the contemplation of] the impermanence of this existence;

"(2) as a means of turning the mind away from attachment to the entirety of cyclic existence, one must meditate on action, cause and result, and on the flaws inherent in cyclic existence;

"(3) as a means of turning one's mind away from concern for one's own happiness and well-being, one must meditate on the awakening mind; and

"(4) as a means of turning one's mind away from perceiver and perceived, one must meditate on emptiness free from all conceptual elaborations."

Should the proponent claim, "The first reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because there is no more profound way to turn the mind from attachment to this life than to meditate on the support for turning the mind, the difficulty of obtaining the freedoms and resources, and on what actually turns the mind, impermanence." [157]

Should the proponent claim, "The second reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because there is no more profound method to turn the mind away from attachment to saṁsāra's happiness than to meditate on what undercuts that way of thinking, namely that saṁsāra is of the nature of suffering."

Should the proponent claim, "The third reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because if one has the mind that desires to establish all sentient beings in the state of enlightenment, one's mind naturally turns away from desiring happiness and well-being for oneself."

Should the proponent claim, "The fourth reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because meditating on emptiness free from all conceptual elaborations is in direct contradiction with thoughts of perceiver and perceived."

ii) Someone may say, "In order to attain the state of Buddhahood, one needs the awakening mind, but there is no way to meditate upon the causes and results of [generating the awakening mind] in stages." The answer to that is, "Given the awakening mind, there are pith instructions of just how to meditate on it in stages, because there are the pith instructions of how to give rise to the awakening mind through [contemplating] five stages of cause and result, and there are the pith instructions of how to give rise to the awakening mind through [contemplating] seven stages of cause and result."

Should the proponent claim, "The first reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because:

"(1) in order to attain the state of Buddhahood, one must have its cause, the awakening mind;

"(2) [the awakening mind's] cause, great compassion, is therefore necessary;

"(3) the cause of that, great loving-kindness, is therefore necessary;

"(4) the cause of that, remembering and being grateful [to all sentient beings] for all they have done for us, is therefore necessary; and

"(5) it is necessary to have the cause of that, which is to think about how it is that all sentient beings have been our mothers. [158]

"These are known in stages, because practicing each preceding stage as the cause leads to the appearance of the succeeding stage as the result."

Should the proponent claim, "The second reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because:

"(1) in order for one to attain the state of Buddhahood for the benefit of sentient beings, one must first have its cause, the awakening mind;

"(2) its cause, a purely altruistic intention, is therefore necessary;

"(3) its cause, great compassion, is therefore necessary;

"(4) its cause, great loving kindness, is therefore necessary,

"(5) its cause, loving kindness in a joyful mind, is therefore necessary;

"(6) its cause, reflecting on what sentient beings have done for us and being so grateful to them for that, is therefore necessary; and

"(7) its cause, meditating on the thought that all sentient beings have been our mothers, is therefore necessary.

"These are known [in stages], because from meditating on the thought that all sentient beings have been our mother the succeeding stage will arise, and so forth—from taking up and meditating upon each preceding stage as a cause, the result of the succeeding stage will appear."

And so forth, this point being established in stages.

Again it is said,

In order to attain complete and perfect Buddhahood,
One must reverse all modes of the mind's conceptual
thinking.

Therefore, it is very important that with great diligence
You meditate on the pith instruction tradition's four
turnings of the mind.

It is also said like that. [159]

8. AN ANALYSIS OF HOW TO VERIFY [WHAT ONE HAS STUDIED AND REFLECTED UPON] THROUGH MEDITATION

- 8.1. The way of accomplishing calm-abiding (*zhi gnas*, *śamatha*) and superior insight (*lhag mthong*, *vipaśyanā*) according to the Middle Way tradition.
- 8.2. A summary of the types of calm abiding and superior insight.
- 8.3. Particularly, the Middle Way schools' explanations of meditative equipoise (*mnyam gzhaḡ*) and subsequent attainment (*rjes thob*).⁹⁵

8.1. THE WAY OF ACCOMPLISHING CALM-ABIDING AND SUPERIOR INSIGHT ACCORDING TO THE MIDDLE WAY TRADITION.

Someone may say, "All proponents of the Middle Way have the same way of accomplishing the union of calm-abiding and superior insight." The answer to that is, "given that subject, it follows that there are differences in their views, because:

"according to the Master of Learning Bhāvaviveka, first one cultivates calm-abiding by focusing on ugliness and loving-kindness, and then through the power of analytical reasoning one cultivates superior insight;

"according to the Master of Learning Śāntideva, first one cultivates calm-abiding by meditating on the awakening mind, and then by focusing on emptiness one cultivates the *prajñā* of superior insight;

"according to the Master of Learning Kamalashīla's *Middle Stages of Meditation*,⁹⁶ first one cultivates calm-abiding by focusing on objects such as an image of the Buddha, and then by analyzing the nature of that image, one accomplishes superior insight; and,

"according to the Master of Learning Candrakīrti, in dependence upon the view that analyzes thatness, one accomplishes both calm-abiding and superior insight."

⁹⁵ *rjes thob* is frequently translated as "post-meditation". Here, it is translated more literally as "subsequent attainment" in order to emphasize, as the term itself does, that if the proper view is maintained, the experiences of the post-meditation stage actually *add* to the realization attained during meditative equipoise.

⁹⁶ {*sgom rim bar pa*}

As is stated in the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,⁹⁷

Though followers of the Middle Way differ with respect to
the method of cultivation,
They agree on what is to be cultivated: the union of calm-
abiding and superior insight. [160]

8.2. A SUMMARY OF THE TYPES OF CALM ABIDING AND SUPERIOR INSIGHT.

8.2.1. A SUMMARY OF THE TYPES OF CALM ABIDING.

In the common vehicle there is the meditation on the nine thoughts of ugliness, the training of the mind in loving-kindness and compassion, and the counting of the breath's [cycles of] inhalation, exhalation and resting.

In the Vajrayāna, there are the methods of the instructions of pratyahara, the visualization of the nāḍīs as hollow pathways, prāṇa yoga, [focus] on the bliss [that arises from] the melting of bindu, visualization of deities, and mantra recitation. [There is also the practice of] resting the mind in its own natural, spacious, and uncontrived state. All of these [methods] are subsumed under the category of calm-abiding.

As stated in the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,⁹⁸

In brief, ugliness, love, counting inhalation and exhalation,
Pratyahara, nāḍīs, prāṇa, creation [stage], recitation,
resting naturally,
All are but methods for developing the concentration
of calm-abiding.

8.2.2. A SUMMARY OF THE TYPES OF SUPERIOR INSIGHT.

There are: the analysis of definition, definiendum, and illustrating example, such as [the study of valid cognition]; the five great reasonings of the Middle Way that cut through conceptual elaborations; and the various ways of introducing the nature of one's own mind directly and nakedly, which include scriptures, reasonings, blessing, and symbols. All of these are methods for giving rise to superior insight, the prajñā that realizes selflessness. As is stated in the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,⁹⁹

⁹⁷ Vol. III, p.132.

⁹⁸ Vol. III, p.134.

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*

Analysis of definition, definiendum, [and example], and of
generally- and specifically-characterized phenomena;
Dependent arising; the five great reasonings; introducing
the nature of one's own mind by means of scripture,
reasoning, and blessing,
All are methods for developing supreme discriminating
prajñā [161]
In accordance with the [varying] faculties of individuals.

8.3. PARTICULARLY, AN ANALYSIS OF THE MIDDLE WAY SCHOOLS' EXPLANATIONS OF MEDITATIVE EQUIPOISE AND SUBSEQUENT ATTAINMENT.

8.3.1. MEDITATIVE EQUIPOISE.

Some might say, "There is no difference in how the various Middle Way schools explain meditative equipoise." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, there are differences, because:

"(1) the followers of the Middle Way Autonomy school first give rise to the awakening mind and discriminating prajñā (*so sor rtogs pa'i shes rab*), and then rest in meditative equipoise in the following way: the meditator is the mind itself, and the object of meditation is the space-like emptiness that is the non-affirming negation of all conceptual elaborations such as existence, nonexistence, and so forth, all of these being of one taste in their essence.

"(2) The followers of the Middle Way Consequence school first give rise to the awakening mind and analytical prajñā, and then rest in the undifferentiability of the meditating mind and the object of meditation, the dharmadhātu. These two [subject and object] are not distinct from each other—they are like water when poured into water.

"(3) The followers of the Middle Way Empty-of-other school first give rise to the awakening mind, then briefly determine with analysis that no inherent nature can be seen, and then abide in the state of the spontaneous, nonconceptual great clear light."

As is stated in the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge*,¹⁰⁰

Particularly, [one determines] the [essential] meaning
of the Middle Way, then [rests in] meditative
equipoise. That is the main [meditation]. [162]
[To elaborate] further, the Autonomy school analyzes
and then rests in the space-like object of [their]
nonaffirming negation.
For the Consequence school, the meditating mind and
the object of meditation, the dharmadhātu,

¹⁰⁰ Vol. III, p.156.

Are undifferentiable, like water poured into water.
The Empty-of-other school rests without conceptualizing
in the great clear light.
With regard to just being free from conceptual
elaborations, which is the essential point, all schools
agree.

8.3.2. SUBSEQUENT ATTAINMENT.

Given the Middle Way tradition, there is a way of meditating in the [stage of] subsequent attainment, because it is to meditate on the thirty-seven branches of enlightenment in stages. As is stated in the same text,¹⁰¹

In subsequent attainment, one meditates on the thirty-
seven branches of enlightenment in stages.
Since [their] meaning is profound, vast, and so forth,
[this method] is extraordinary.

Again it is said,

With a practice of perfect meditation
That joins calm-abiding and superior insight in this way,
You will cut through everything that binds you either to
existence or peace,
So why shouldn't you speedily attain non-abiding nirvāṇa?

¹⁰¹ Vol. III, p.158.

9. AN EXAMINATION OF THE MANNER OF PROGRESSING ALONG THE GROUNDS AND PATHS

9.1. SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY WISH TO UNDERSTAND MIGHT GRASP THE DEFINITIONS EASILY, THEY ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER IN ONE PLACE. [163]

- i) The foundation for progressing towards nirvāṇa, and the accumulation of virtue in a way that is concordant with liberation, is the path of accumulation. Its illustrating example is everything included in the application of effort in listening, reflecting, and meditating, from the time one first gives rise to the awakening mind until the time one gives rise to the primordial awareness of warmth.
- ii) The gateway to complete liberation that consists of the stage where one has a manifest understanding of the actual nature, is the path of junction. Its illustrating example is the prajñā that arises from mundane meditation [that exists] from the time that the primordial awareness of warmth arises until the path of seeing is reached.
- iii) The foundation for progressing to nirvāṇa that consists of the stage of newly and directly realizing thatness, is the path of seeing. Its illustrating example is concordant calm-abiding and superior insight that transcend the mundane.
- iv) The gateway to complete liberation that consists of the stage of becoming habituated to extraordinary samādhi, is the path of meditation. Its illustrating example is the process of becoming familiar with and habituated to the actuality of the direct realization of true being that occurred on the path of seeing.
- v) The foundation for attaining nirvāṇa, which consists of the state of realization of the final object of meditation, is the path of no more learning. The illustrating example is the [bodhisattva] at the end of the tenth ground's continuum [entering] the vajra-like samādhi that gives up even the subtlest of subtle afflictive and cognitive obscurations, and having done so, going on to abide in the Buddha's ground, the eleventh, called "All-Light". [164]
- vi) The foundation and support for the progressive increase of the arising of prajñā that directly realizes selflessness and that is endowed with extraordinary qualities in the mindstream of a bodhisattva is a Ground (bhūmi) of the Great Vehicle's Noble Ones.
- vii) The above, [and specifically] the level of attainment where the practice of the transcendent perfection of generosity becomes supreme and that directly leads to attaining the second ground is the First Ground.

The definitions of the succeeding grounds should be derived by connecting the above with the [succeeding] nine transcendent perfections.

**9.2. SO THAT THOSE MAINLY INTERESTED IN REASONING
MIGHT QUICKLY ENGAGE IN IT,
THE REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER.**

- i) Should someone say, "If it is a path of the Great Vehicle, it is definitely the path of seeing," then the answer is, "Given the Great Vehicle's path of accumulation, that [would then] follow, because it is that [a path of the Great Vehicle]."
- ii) Should someone say, "If it is the Noble one's path, it is the path of meditation," then the answer is, "Given the path of seeing, that [would then] follow, because it is that [a path of the Noble ones]."
- iii) Should someone say, "If it is the Great Vehicle path, it is the path of junction," then the answer is, "Given the Great Vehicle path of accumulation, that [would then] follow, because it is that [a Great Vehicle path]," and so forth, these points being established in stages.
- iv) Should someone say, "If it is a ground that is the support for supreme qualities, it is a ground of the Great Vehicle's Noble ones," then the answer is, "Given the grounds of the Hearers and Solitary Realizers, that [would then] follow, because they are those [grounds that are the support for supreme qualities]," and so forth, this point being established in stages. [165]

**9.3. IN CONCLUSION, A SUMMARIZING VERSE
SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE MAY DO SO EASILY.**

Like that, when conventional analysis is at work,
There are many different things realized and things
 abandoned on the ten grounds and five paths.
However, since in the actual reality of clear light they
 are all of one taste,
Just rest within the expanse and awareness
 undifferentiable.

It is also said like that.

10. AN ANALYSIS OF THE ULTIMATE FRUITION, THE KĀYAS AND WISDOMS

10.1. SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY WISH TO UNDERSTAND MIGHT GRASP THE DEFINITIONS EASILY, THEY ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER IN ONE PLACE.

- i) The suchness of all phenomena, which are completely pure by their very nature, is the nirvāṇa of the way things naturally are.
- ii) The cessation that occurs through the weakening of the seed by the mundane paths is the designated nirvāṇa of cessation.
- iii) The cessation that is the attainment of the paths of seeing and meditation is the actual genuine cessation.
- iv) When the Buddhas and bodhisattvas, through the power of their wisdom and compassion, fall neither into the extreme of existence nor the extreme of peace, this is non-abiding nirvāṇa.
- v) To be endowed with the three Great Things¹⁰² is to be the Buddha. [166]
- vi) The most excellent abandonment that is the vanquishing of the two obscurations together with their habitual tendencies that occurs at the very end of the vajra-like samādhi is the kāya of the essence itself (*ngo bo nyid sku, svabhāvakāya*).
- vii) The most excellent realization, the "primordial awareness that knows all things just as they are" (*ji lta ji snyed mkhyen pa'i ye shes*) having direct vision of and mastery over all phenomena, is the dharmakāya (*chos sku*).
- viii) The kāya ornamented by marks and signs that resides in the Richly Adorned Highest Pure Land, that [abides] together with the noble [bodhisattvas] and that uninterruptedly enjoys only the Dharma of the Great Vehicle is the Enjoyment Kāya (*longs spyod sku, sambhogakāya*).
- ix) The display of various emanations that perform the benefit of beings while never moving from the dharmadhātu is the Emanation Kāya (*sprul ku, nirmanakāya*).
- x) The completely pure dharmadhātu, the suchness of all phenomena, the unmistakable nature, the direct

¹⁰² The three Great Things (*chen po gsum*) are: the Great Abandonment (*spang pa chen po*), which is the kāya completely purified of the two obscurations together with their habitual tendencies; the Great Realization (*rtogs pa chen po*), which is the primordial awareness that sees the maṇḍala of all objects of knowledge just as it is; and the Great Mind (*sems chen po*), which spontaneously performs the benefit of all sentient beings always and everywhere. *Treasury of Knowledge*, Vol. III, p.593.

cause of the arising of all the Noble ones' qualities, and the very identity of all the Thus Gone Ones, is Dharmadātu wisdom.

xi) The clear awareness of all objects at all times, that is like a mirror reflecting [what appears before it], and that arises from the absence of clinging to "I", is Mirror-like wisdom.

xii) When [the Noble one has become] familiar with and has purified the path of learning's meditation on the equality of self and other, this leads to the attainment of non-abiding nirvāṇa and the awareness of the equality of existence and peace, and that is the Wisdom of equality.

xiii) The knowledge of all objects of knowledge, however many there may be, that discriminates unmistakably between generally- and specifically-characterized [phenomena] is Individually discriminating wisdom. [167]

xiv) The myriad play of skillful means that know how to perform the benefit of beings is All-accomplishing wisdom.

**10.2. SO THAT THOSE MAINLY INTERESTED IN REASONING
MIGHT QUICKLY ENGAGE IN IT,
THE REFUTATIONS AND PROOFS ARE TAUGHT TOGETHER.**

i) Someone may say, "The three kāyas do not have any specific qualities." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, it follows [that they do have specific qualities], because they have the quality of equality, the quality of permanence, and the quality of appearance."

Should the proponent claim, "The first reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because: the dharmakāyas of all the Buddhas are equal because they are not different from their support, the dharmadhātu; all the Buddhas' enjoyment kāyas are equal because they do not differ in their purpose; and all the Buddhas' emanation kāyas are equal because their activity is common," and so forth, this point being established by each successive reason above.

Should the proponent claim, "The second reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because: since the dharmakāya is that which is actually and genuinely free from arising and ceasing, it is the permanence of the true nature; since the enjoyment kāya enjoys the Dharma without interruption, it is the permanence of the never-waning continuum; and although the emanation kāya does cease to appear, it returns again and again to teach, so although it is not continuous in terms of the same [emanation always appearing], its time is never past, so it is the permanence of the continuum of activity."

Should the proponent claim, "The third reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because when the cognitive obscurations [that block realization of] the dharmadātu are purified, the dharmakāya appears; [168] when the obscurations of the afflictions are purified, the enjoyment kāya appears; and when the obscurations of activity are purified, the emanation kāya appears."

ii) Someone may say, "The two form kāyas are just the pure vision of the disciples." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, they are not only that, because the blessing of the dharmakāya, the disciples' pure vision,

and the aspiration prayers [that the Buddha made when He was a bodhisattva] all must come together [for the form kāyas to appear]," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

iii) Someone may say, "The three kāyas have different natures." The answer to that is, "Given that subject, that does not follow, because there is the flaw that if things that exist at the same time are different reverses and different essences, there is no connection between them," and so forth, this point being established in stages.

iv) Someone may say, "If primordial awareness is inherent in the ground, 'transformation' does not make sense." The answer to that is, "Given the tradition that posits the inherent existence of primordial awareness in the ground, transformation is appropriate, because when adventitious stains are purified, it is appropriate for transformation to occur. For example, the sky freed of clouds, water purified of dirt, and gold refined of impurities."

v) Some claim that although transformation is appropriate, no manner in which transformation could occur exists. The answer to that is, "Given the tradition that posits transformation, there is a way for it to occur, which is as follows: the all-base consciousness's emptiness aspect transformed is dharmadātu wisdom; its clarity aspect transformed is mirror-like wisdom; the afflicted mind transformed is the wisdom of equality; [169] the mental consciousness transformed is individually discriminating wisdom; and the five sense consciousnesses transformed are all-accomplishing wisdom.

vi) Someone may say, "The presentation of the five wisdoms is inappropriate, because there is no way of connecting them with the three kāyas." The answer to that is, "Given the five wisdoms, there is a way of connecting them with the three kāyas, because: the dharmakāya includes dharmadātu wisdom and mirror-like wisdom; the enjoyment kāya includes the wisdom of equality and individually discriminating wisdom; and the emanation kāya includes all-accomplishing wisdom.

vii) Someone may say, "At the level of Buddhahood, primordial awareness must either exist or not exist, whichever is appropriate." The answer to that is, "Given the Buddha's primordial awareness, it follows that it is neither actually and genuinely existent nor actually and genuinely nonexistent, because actual genuine reality is free from all conceptual elaborations."

Should the proponent claim, "The reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because [actual genuine truth] is beyond being an object of conceptual mind."

Should the proponent claim, "That reason is not a quality of the subject," the answer is, "Yes it is, because all of the mind's designations of 'existent' and 'nonexistent' are all completely false," and so forth, this point being established with many enumerations of reasons.

10.3. IN CONCLUSION, A SUMMARIZING VERSE SO THAT THOSE WHO MAINLY PRACTICE MAY DO SO EASILY.

Like that are the kāyas and wisdoms of the fruition,
And although conventional valid cognition can

designate them to be separate and distinct, [170]
When examined by valid cognition that understands
emptiness, they are nowhere to be found.
Ultimate reality transcends the extremes of existence
and nonexistence.

It is also said like that.

CONCLUSION

Like that, this *Miraculous Key of Summarized Reasonings*, that is taken from the path of reasonings [as it is explained in] the *Precious Treasury of Knowledge's* ten chapters and the *Ocean of Texts on Logic*, opens the door of the *Ocean of Texts on Logic* in ten directions. Its flawless refutations and proofs cut through the doubts that [afflict] the mindstreams of self and others, and dispel the shadows of no understanding, wrong understanding, and doubt concerning the precious teachings of the Buddha of scripture and realization. With flawless scriptures and reasonings, may you all put great effort into the task of ripening oceans of sentient beings.

Again it is said,

What cuts through all the shackles of existence and peace
Is the profound and vast way of Dharma, whose deep
 meaning, difficult to fathom,
We must be led to on the path of flawless reasoning.
Therefore, hold dear this *Miraculous Key* to reason's path.

The Lord of the world, the supremely victorious Karmapa,
Amassed the *Ocean of Texts on Logic*,
And since fresh minds must [cause this ocean to flow into]
 the ocean of their own intelligence,
Hold dear this *Miraculous Key* to reason's path.

In order to make the pleasing offering of mental acuity
To the all-pervading Lord, Rangjung Rigpe Dorje, [171]
One must open the treasure chest that contains the path of
 reasoning's gems.
Therefore, hold dear this *Miraculous Key* to reason's path.

When the sun of the extraordinary emanation rises,
The darkness of wrong views and doubts will be dispelled.
For this to happen, fresh minds must cultivate the lotus of
 their intelligence,
So hold dear this *Miraculous Key* to reason's path.

You assembly of fresh minds who believe in reasoning's
 [power]
Can ripen your mindstreams by listening, reflecting, and
 meditating.
Since we must ripen the mindstreams of others with the
 path of reasoning,
Hold dear this *Miraculous Key* to reason's path.

Through the power of this virtue, so that the great and
excellent beings
May perform their own benefit by perfecting their listening,
reflecting, and meditating,
And perform the benefit of others by ripening beings with
the four means of magnetizing,¹⁰³
May [the stance of] your lotus feet [on this Earth] be as
strong as a diamond.

Through the power of that, may the Victorious One's
teachings of scripture and realization,
The only medicine that can completely alleviate the sickness
of beings,
Actually heal any and all, without any bias—
May the Victorious One's teachings flourish until saṁsāra
is finished.

And so, at the request of the Gyalwang Karmapa's shedra Śrī Nālandā Institute's senior class, [172] the one studying the *Commentary on Valid Cognition*,¹⁰⁴ whose members said that "[If such a book] is composed, it would bring waves of benefit to future students," and who offered the second most precious metal along with the divine touch of a pure and white [silk offering scarf], on the nineteenth of January, 1986, this has been set down by the Khenpo named Tsültrim Gyamtso.

¹⁰³ The "four means of magnetizing" refers to the progressive stages of the way that spiritual teachers should act in relation to their disciples. In order to first gather disciples, teachers should be generous. Then, while the disciples still do not have the ability to understand the profound Dharma, teachers should speak pleasantly, for example by telling stories. Next, they should teach the Dharma of the three vehicles. Finally, their own view, meditation and conduct should not vary from those that they are teaching to others.

¹⁰⁴ {tsad ma rnam 'grel} *Pramāṇavartika*.